

Exhibit 4

Chats Affirmatively Turning History Off (See Appendix C)

Exhibit 4A

Custodian: Nitish Korula

Witness: Nitish Korula

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-B-003992377

Trial Exhibit No.: PTX0891

Message

From: Nitish Korula [nitish@google.com]
Sent: 11/12/2019 8:59:25 PM
To: Jonathan Pearson [finchley@google.com]; Uchechi Okereke [uchechi@google.com]; Curt Harting [rcharting@google.com]

- **Nitish Korula**, 2019-11-12 12:59:25

Curt, Jonathan: Can we preserve old DT files from the last 60 days

- **Curt Harting**, 2019-11-12 12:59:35

Talked to Chech now

- **Nitish Korula**, 2019-11-12 12:59:39

Ok, great

- **Curt Harting**, 2019-11-12 12:59:47

Will email Jonathan to get him up to speed

- **Uchechi Okereke**, 2019-11-12 12:59:49

Please can we turn history off?

Exhibit 4B

Custodian: Bonita Stewart

Witness: Bonita Stewart

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-B-004309756

Trial Exhibit No.: PTX0896

Message

From: Cyrus Beagley [cbeagley@google.com]
Sent: 12/3/2019 7:24:25 PM
To: Bonita Stewart [bonita@google.com]

• **Cyrus Beagley, 2019-12-03 11:24:25**

Hi Bonita -- Kristina has signed her offer and I've had a chance to loop in Jeff and Sam (and Jono). Am planning to send the announcement out more broadly tomorrow. OK to include your leads? Let me know if you would prefer to touch base with your team in advance; happy to hold off for a day or two if needed. Kristina is also meeting with Michael to explore options to bring him onto the team. We'll see where that goes.

• **Cyrus Beagley, 2019-12-03 11:24:37**

Thanks again for all your help throughout this process.

• **Bonita Stewart, 2019-12-03 11:29:03**

yes. please include my team. That would be great

• **Cyrus Beagley, 2019-12-03 11:29:10**

thanks

• **Bonita Stewart, 2019-12-03 11:40:29**

fyi. on your chats you have the history turned on. we are advised to turn history off so messages are cleared after 24 hours

• **Cyrus Beagley, 2019-12-03 11:41:50**

oh i didn't know that -- i've turned it on so i don't lose messages! I'll turn it off then...



Exhibit 4C

Custodian: Prabhakar Raghavan; Sundar Pichai

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-018356212

Message

From: sundar@google.com [sundar@google.com]
Sent: 3/3/2020 4:16:47 PM
To: sundar@google.com; pragh@google.com
Subject: AAAAp7ODYgY-vShZM9-mPYU

- **sundar@google.com** 2020-03-03T16:16:47.476Z

We can have everyone join at noon

- **pragh@google.com** 2020-03-03T16:18:35.601Z

Let's decide at noon whether to recreate as a History off group chat

- **pragh@google.com** 2020-03-03T16:19:27.562Z

The chat within video meetings loses history when the call ends I believe, but I'll confirm

Exhibit 4D

Custodian: Prabhakar Raghavan

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-018356213

Message

From: pragh@google.com [pragh@google.com]
Sent: 3/3/2020 4:32:40 PM
To: pragh@google.com
Subject: AAAAp7ODYgY-9Ew-eP8uiec

- **pragh@google.com** 2020-03-03T16:32:40.586Z

ok team false start - by the IRC semantics of chat Rooms, History remains ON - so I'm going to kill this room and re-create as a group chat with History OFF. sorry about that

Exhibit 4E

Custodian: Bonita Stewart; Jason Washing

Witness: Bonita Stewart

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-010699441

Message

From: Bonita Stewart [bonita@google.com]
Sent: 4/8/2020 8:03:24 PM
To: Jason Washing [jwashing@google.com]

• **Bonita Stewart, 2020-04-08 13:03:24**

Thanks for your input pulling together the N&P relief program. I know you've had all hands on deck working through the details - thank you!

• **Jason Washing, 2020-04-08 13:04:37**

hi, thanks so much. It's been an around the clock effort. I'm extremely proud of what we are doing it and how we have done it under extraordinary circumstances...

• **Bonita Stewart, 2020-04-08 13:04:49**

agreed

• **Bonita Stewart, 2020-04-08 13:04:56**

It should be well received

• **Jason Washing, 2020-04-08 13:05:03**

I hope so

• **Bonita Stewart, 2020-04-08 13:05:21**

well we will always have 1-2 naysayers

• **Jason Washing, 2020-04-08 13:05:29**

yes!

• **Jason Washing, 2020-04-08 13:05:36**

and we know who they are

• **Jason Washing, 2020-04-08 13:05:39**

ugh

• **Jason Washing, 2020-04-08 13:05:54**

but this is one heck of an olive branch

• **Bonita Stewart, 2020-04-08 13:06:12**

btw you might want to turn your chat history off

• **Jason Washing, 2020-04-08 13:06:21**

geez

• **Jason Washing, 2020-04-08 13:06:25**

for sure!

• **Jason Washing, 2020-04-08 13:06:28**

thank you!

Exhibit 4F

Custodian: Adam Juda; Marcel Crasmaru

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-008384936

Message

From: nazli@google.com [nazli@google.com]
Sent: 8/8/2022 3:55:25 PM
To: nazli@google.com; dkantak@google.com; tinaweyand@google.com; juda@google.com
Subject: AAAALQ3NNnE-MBI-FLAT:2022-08-07T20:55:38.064031

- **nazli@google.com** 2022-08-08T15:55:25.067Z

Updated room membership.

- **nazli@google.com** 2022-08-08T15:55:38.064Z

Adding all the invitees from the war room

- **nazli@google.com** 2022-08-08T15:55:43.458Z

see you all at 1230 PM PT

- **nazli@google.com** 2022-08-08T15:55:52.821Z

we will move this to a EU friendlier slot starting tomorrow

- **nazli@google.com** 2022-08-08T15:55:54.072Z

apologies

- **dkantak@google.com** 2022-08-08T16:34:29.681Z

thank you Nazli! see you all at 12:30p

- **tinaweyand@google.com** 2022-08-08T17:22:09.830Z

I've added Chrissy Seib to today

- **juda@google.com** 2022-08-08T17:22:45.678Z

so it's no longer a Tech-only meeting?

- **juda@google.com** 2022-08-08T17:24:15.121Z

Also, I see that History is on in this chat. If that can't be changed, can I please be removed from this discussion?

- **tinaweyand@google.com** 2022-08-08T17:25:36.294Z

today includes GPL - we need advertiser feedback.

- **nazli@google.com** 2022-08-08T17:25:40.284Z

agreed lets remove

Exhibit 4G

Custodian: Chris LaSala

Witness: Chris LaSala

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-B-004008622

Trial Exhibit No.: PTX1818

Message

From: Chris LaSala [chrisl@google.com]
Sent: 8/18/2020 5:54:07 PM
To: Nash Islam [nashislam@google.com]

- **Chris LaSala, 2020-08-18 10:54:07**
hi
- **Nash Islam, 2020-08-18 11:02:26**
hi
- **Chris LaSala, 2020-08-18 11:03:00**
need 30 mins - in mtg with Philipp re: chrome
- **Nash Islam, 2020-08-18 11:03:32**
k no prob, ping me after. im avail in 30
- **Nash Islam, 2020-08-18 11:53:16**
on separate note from IDFA, we have burning issues with a multical launch
- **Chris LaSala, 2020-08-18 11:53:27**
uh oh
- **Nash Islam, 2020-08-18 11:53:30**
you'll hear about it if not across your desk already
- **Chris LaSala, 2020-08-18 11:53:39**
not caught up on email
- **Nash Islam, 2020-08-18 11:53:39**
will likely be VP escalations
- **Chris LaSala, 2020-08-18 11:53:45**
why?
- **Nash Islam, 2020-08-18 11:54:27**
major negative revenue impact to a number of off platform pubs
- **Nash Islam, 2020-08-18 11:54:46**
who are multicaling. There are two camps - aggressive and non aggressive multical
- **Nash Islam, 2020-08-18 11:55:12**
this was a buyside launch with sellside PM informed, but not as approvers
- **Nash Islam, 2020-08-18 11:55:27**
we learned about it at 20% rollout last week and its scaled up to 50% yest
- **Nash Islam, 2020-08-18 11:55:53**
for Jeff Birnbaum's book alone its \$20M+ impact, \$10M to Zynga
- **Nash Islam, 2020-08-18 11:56:22**
siyoung and I can brief you directly soon if helpful
- **Nash Islam, 2020-08-18 11:56:43**

and Siyoung will send an email brief too

- **Nash Islam**, 2020-08-18 11:56:45

to you

- **Nash Islam**, 2020-08-18 11:56:57

impact list -

- **Nash Islam**, 2020-08-18 11:56:58

https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1l22TKgWUBfprLiEXvSqDJpiHEJJCJdAh4sHAU9WfiEc/edit#gid=0

- **Chris LaSala**, 2020-08-18 12:02:53

are you free in 15 mins?

- **Nash Islam**, 2020-08-18 12:05:30

Yep for multicall or idfa or both?

- **Nash Islam**, 2020-08-18 12:05:42

If multicall will include siyoung

- **Chris LaSala**, 2020-08-18 12:08:20

both

- **Chris LaSala**, 2020-08-18 12:08:23

3:20 EST

- **Nash Islam**, 2020-08-18 12:21:19

Cool ping when ready

- **Chris LaSala**, 2020-08-18 12:21:20

ok

- **Chris LaSala**, 2020-08-18 12:21:24

ni-cl

- **Nash Islam**, 2020-08-18 12:21:28

Siyoung joining too

- **Chris LaSala**, 2020-08-18 12:21:38

ok

- **Nash Islam**, 2020-08-18 12:51:03

impact nums are ~50M for Jeff B's \$250M book. \$25M from Zynga and \$25M for Unity. Unity may be a sissie escalation given her relationship

- **Chris LaSala**, 2020-08-18 13:01:59

do you know how much buy-side changes are because of efficiency;

- **Chris LaSala**, 2020-08-18 13:02:07

vs decreased win rate

- **Chris LaSala**, 2020-08-18 13:02:24

because if a big part is decreased win rate, we'd expect buy-side to adjust

- **Chris LaSala**, 2020-08-18 13:02:30

so the loss will come back

- **Nash Islam**, 2020-08-18 13:02:53

don't know but will look into. good q

- **Chris LaSala**, 2020-08-18 13:03:06

ok

- **Chris LaSala**, 2020-08-18 13:03:18

also, maybe start an off the record ping thread with Duke, you, me

- **Chris LaSala**, 2020-08-18 13:03:20

about this

- **Chris LaSala**, 2020-08-18 13:03:28

and let's the 3 of us get on the same page

- **Chris LaSala**, 2020-08-18 13:03:37

about what, if anything, we (sell-side) should do about it

- **Nash Islam**, 2020-08-18 13:03:57

k kicking off now

Exhibit 4H

Custodian: Chris LaSala

Witness: Chris LaSala

Bates No.: GOOG-DOJ-AT-01828942

Trial Exhibit No.: PTX0992

Message

From: Chris LaSala [chrisl@google.com]
Sent: 9/16/2020 2:38:03 PM
To: Nash Islam [nashislam@google.com]

• **Chris LaSala**, 2020-09-16 07:38:03

why would a perfect SKAd solve the IDFA consent issue?

• **Nash Islam**, 2020-09-16 07:48:41

sissie has signed off

• **Chris LaSala**, 2020-09-16 07:51:10

we need to communicate this to Duke and Naomi

• **Chris LaSala**, 2020-09-16 07:51:18

essentially we pull any discussion of email

• **Chris LaSala**, 2020-09-16 07:51:21

or log-in

• **Chris LaSala**, 2020-09-16 07:51:22

right?

• **Nash Islam**, 2020-09-16 07:51:36

yep

• **Nash Islam**, 2020-09-16 07:51:47

aligned with the direction we're heading

• **Nash Islam**, 2020-09-16 07:52:21

looks like best we can do is #3 in the email mention options

• **Nash Islam**, 2020-09-16 07:52:24

https://docs.google.com/document/d/1vR5BnzSkJoMIxoqsSwuRQZo5TkBO82Av2-JqsPN23g0/edit#heading=h.ujxavbs6qxmh

• **Nash Islam**, 2020-09-16 07:54:22

Should i send an email to Duke & Naomi right now on this?

• **Nash Islam**, 2020-09-16 07:56:00

"Per discussion with Spero & his feedback from PS, we should avoid direct mentions of sign-in and email consent in our MSA to align with the negotiating strategy where we will not be specific about our alternative approach for measurement and attribution"

• **Nash Islam**, 2020-09-16 07:56:23

or too sensitive for email so keep on ping?

• **Chris LaSala**, 2020-09-16 07:58:32

start a ping with history turned off

- **Chris LaSala**, 2020-09-16 07:58:40

duke, naomi, alex, me

- **Nash Islam**, 2020-09-16 07:59:33

k

Exhibit 4I

Custodian: Amin Charaniya; Joan Braddi; Vidhya Srinivasan

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-018491727

Message

From: vids@google.com [vids@google.com]
Sent: 10/6/2020 5:48:31 PM
To: bpanda@google.com; touma@google.com; acharaniya@google.com; joan@google.com; vids@google.com; lawrencechang@google.com; karthik@google.com; philm@google.com; nickyc@google.com
Subject: _1S9sQAAAAE-2020.10.06

- **vids@google.com** 2020-10-06T17:48:31.936Z

pls turn off history

- **lawrencechang@google.com** 2020-10-06T17:49:35.187Z

oh i see. let's be careful there, karthik.

- **acharaniya@google.com** 2020-10-06T17:51:49.886Z

touma has some extension that keeps turning history on

- **touma@google.com** 2020-10-06T17:52:36.119Z

it's probably easier to remove me from the chat group while i find the extension

Exhibit 4J

Custodian: Vidhya Srinivasan

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-014680318

Trial Exhibit No.: PTX1000

Message

From: Vidhya Srinivasan [vids@google.com]
Sent: 10/29/2020 4:44:03 PM
To: Christophe Combette [ccombette@google.com]

• **Vidhya Srinivasan, 2020-10-29 09:44:03**

hi

• **Vidhya Srinivasan, 2020-10-29 09:44:09**

is there a new deck for mtg tomorrow?

• **Christophe Combette, 2020-10-29 09:44:16**

working on it now

• **Christophe Combette, 2020-10-29 09:44:24**

will share before noon

• **Vidhya Srinivasan, 2020-10-29 09:44:25**

thanks

• **Christophe Combette, 2020-10-29 09:45:42**

have you seen the deck for later today?

• **Christophe Combette, 2020-10-29 09:45:44**

https://docs.google.com/presentation/d/1RB4uFprGQtEjmBkk5MLrjU4rZVVrTL01LkLL_TZ86FY/edit#slide=id.ga506638254_0_5

• **Vidhya Srinivasan, 2020-10-29 09:47:02**

what should I pay attention to?

• **Christophe Combette, 2020-10-29 09:47:40**

mostly the timeline

• **Christophe Combette, 2020-10-29 09:48:03**

and the content of the messaging strategy on p4

• **Christophe Combette, 2020-10-29 09:48:39**

essentially plan is to go out with something that talks about Anning but doesn't say whether we will comply or not (just that we won't use IDFA).

• **Christophe Combette, 2020-10-29 09:49:00**

Backchannel with the press to try focus the PR on competition

• **Christophe Combette, 2020-10-29 09:49:08**

(for Apple)

• **Christophe Combette, 2020-10-29 09:49:18**

If it lands, we go with Plan A

• **Christophe Combette, 2020-10-29 09:49:28**

if we land in privacy narratives, we fall back on plan B

- **Vidhya Srinivasan**, 2020-10-29 09:49:40

this is good..we should add to deck tomorrow

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 09:49:46

yes

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 09:49:51

I am using this

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 09:50:02

and then going to add more detail on "dreadlines" after phase A

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 09:50:10

phase A = initial blog

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 09:50:17

the one thing I uncovered yesterday

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 09:50:27

and might come up tomorrow if you are talking to Hiroshi

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 09:50:40

it seems as though Android isn't sold on announcing Anning

- **Vidhya Srinivasan**, 2020-10-29 09:51:04

can we go thru this together at 5:30pm

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 09:51:09

we need to bring them into the conversation more

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 09:51:14

yes

- **Vidhya Srinivasan**, 2020-10-29 09:51:22

or 5

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 09:51:58

just sent you an invite for 5:30

- **Vidhya Srinivasan**, 2020-10-29 09:52:10

ok

- **Vidhya Srinivasan**, 2020-10-29 09:59:58

Does the new French suit against Apple change our strategy

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 10:01:29

I would assume it helps

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 10:01:44

the two are very unrelated in that this is about wholesale of hardware

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 10:01:48

and the app store

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 10:02:10

but on the surface, the story is "Apple's behavior is not healthy for competition";

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 10:02:41

it's the kind of tidbit they would add to the articles, like Epic

- **Vidhya Srinivasan**, 2020-10-29 10:06:21

what was the exact suit

- **Vidhya Srinivasan**, 2020-10-29 10:06:28

exact

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 10:06:42

https://www.cnn.com/2020/03/16/tech/apple-fine-france/index.html

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 10:08:09

do you know if our pings are privileged / discoverable?

- **Vidhya Srinivasan**, 2020-10-29 10:08:39

we should turn history off

Exhibit 4K

Custodian: Adam Juda

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-B-004468045

Message

From: John Winfield [winfield@google.com]
Sent: 11/12/2020 1:05:09 AM
To: Liang Ge [lge@google.com]; Myles Sussman [masussman@google.com]; Anand Murugappan [anandmu@google.com]; Ashwin Mysore [ashwinmysore@google.com]; Greg Friedman [gjf@google.com]; Pallavi Garg [pallavigarg@google.com]; Chris Liu [liuxi@google.com]; R. Srikant [srikant@google.com]; Ramakrishnan Kandhan [kramak@google.com]; Seth Micarelli [sethmic@google.com]; Ricardo Suarez [ricardosuarez@google.com]; John Green [johndgreen@google.com]; Milan Mitrović [milanm@google.com]; Darshan Kantak [dkantak@google.com]; Adam Juda [juda@google.com]; Lars Hirsch [hirschl@google.com]
Subject: Upcoming Commerce launches drop 5%+ ads revenue

- **John Winfield**, 2020-11-11 17:05:09

https://groups.google.com/a/google.com/g/aq-launches/c/mv4lKXSg1-E

- **John Winfield**, 2020-11-11 17:05:43

that's the launch as viewed from aq-launches

- **John Winfield**, 2020-11-11 17:06:27

but, this begs the question: who is on shopping-ads-commerce-headsup

- **John Winfield**, 2020-11-11 17:06:33

if Adam doesn't have access

- **Adam Juda**, 2020-11-11 17:07:01

How do we turn History off? I don't do History on ☺

Exhibit 4L

Custodian: Amin Charaniya

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-010087323

Message

From: touma@google.com [touma@google.com]
Sent: 1/27/2021 5:50:32 PM
To: touma@google.com; acharaniya@google.com; iwn@google.com; sreddy@google.com; marcuskrauss@google.com; timir@google.com; dardelean@google.com; ccombette@google.com; vitalyr@google.com
Subject: AAAAol8aKxE-MBI-THREADED:XJTrM1ggpUs%%2021-01-26T22:50:32.185919
Attachments: Screen Shot 2021-01-28 at 9.39.34 AM.png; Screen Shot 2021-01-28 at 9.39.34 AM.png

- **touma@google.com** 2021-01-27T17:50:32.185Z

For Onduo's audit, looks like Amin is the only confirmed attendee from Ringo. @Amin Charaniya, can you drive the questions?

- **Deleted on**2022-07-21T17:50:32.185Z

For Onduo's audit, looks like Amin is the only confirmed attendee from Ringo. @Amin Charaniya, can you drive the questions?

- **acharaniya@google.com** 2021-01-27T17:52:03.969Z

i think it's better for the code red team is supposed to be driving. we (ads) will attend the first few sessions but my hope is for ads to not be driving these interviews

- **Deleted on**2022-07-21T17:52:03.969Z

i think it's better for the code red team is supposed to be driving. we (ads) will attend the first few sessions but my hope is for ads to not be driving these interviews

- **touma@google.com** 2021-01-27T17:53:42.457Z

who from CR team should be driving? @Sri Reddy, pls confirm.

- **Deleted on**2022-07-21T17:53:42.457Z

who from CR team should be driving? @Sri Reddy, pls confirm.

- **iwn@google.com** 2021-01-27T18:04:46.610Z

i know the least of everyone but happy to jump in if we really have nobody

- **Deleted on**2022-07-21T18:04:46.610Z

i know the least of everyone but happy to jump in if we really have nobody

- **iwn@google.com** 2021-01-27T18:05:01.522Z

(the group might regret that 😊)

- **Deleted on**2022-07-21T18:05:01.522Z

(the group might regret that 😊)

- **sreddy@google.com** 2021-01-27T18:15:47.346Z

Let's ask Dan to drive if he can

- **Deleted on**2022-07-21T18:15:47.346Z

Let's ask Dan to drive if he can

- **marcuskrauss@google.com** 2021-01-27T18:21:39.187Z

For OnDuo specifically, it looks like answering question 7 is really what needs to be solved here. 7) Can teams who access it subsequently transform it to inform Ads or a 3P that could use the data for marketing? If no, submit nutrition label for upload.

- **Deleted on**2022-07-21T18:21:39.187Z

For OnDuo specifically, it looks like answering question 7 is really what needs to be solved here. 7) Can teams who access it subsequently transform it to inform Ads or a 3P that could use the data for marketing? If no, submit nutrition label for upload.

- **touma@google.com** 2021-01-27T18:22:03.794Z

We asked Dan; he plans on joining the meetings for the large apps.

- **Deleted on**2022-07-21T18:22:03.794Z

We asked Dan; he plans on joining the meetings for the large apps.

- **marcuskrauss@google.com** 2021-01-27T18:22:08.681Z

The team has left it blank, so someone that may be able to talk them through that would help

- **Deleted on**2022-07-21T18:22:08.681Z

The team has left it blank, so someone that may be able to talk them through that would help

- **touma@google.com** 2021-01-27T18:22:33.215Z

We should cancel Onduo's audit if no one is available to drive it. I

- **Updated on**2021-01-27T18:25:13.655Z

We should cancel Onduo's audit if no one is available to drive it.

- **Deleted on**2022-07-21T18:22:33.215Z

We should cancel Onduo's audit if no one is available to drive it.

- **iwn@google.com** 2021-01-27T18:23:45.604Z

onduo sounds straightforward enough

- **Deleted on**2022-07-21T18:23:45.604Z

onduo sounds straightforward enough

- **iwn@google.com** 2021-01-27T18:24:55.605Z

i think we can do this together

- **Deleted on**2022-07-21T18:24:55.605Z

i think we can do this together

- **touma@google.com** 2021-01-27T18:28:51.865Z

confirming @Irene Nyavor will drive onduo's audit. Thanks!

- **Deleted on**2022-07-21T18:28:51.865Z

confirming @Irene Nyavor will drive onduo's audit. Thanks!

- **iwn@google.com** 2021-01-27T20:01:44.916Z

Touma and Marcus - thank you both for organizing and wrangling this morning's meetings

- **Deleted on**2022-07-21T20:01:44.916Z

Touma and Marcus - thank you both for organizing and wrangling this morning's meetings

- **touma@google.com** 2021-01-27T20:05:54.622Z

great work today and thanks to all attendees!

- **Deleted on**2022-07-21T20:05:54.622Z

great work today and thanks to all attendees!

- **timir@google.com** 2021-01-27T23:26:57.344Z

Hey guys - I won't be able to make it to our meetings tomorrow from 9:00 - 10:00am (Classroom and Arts and Culture). Have a doc appointment. will be able to make it to our 10:00am meeting. @Touma Kunjo @Marcus Krauss fyi -

- Deleted on 2022-07-21T23:26:57.344Z

Hey guys - I won't be able to make it to our meetings tomorrow from 9:00 - 10:00am (Classroom and Arts and Culture). Have a doc appointment. will be able to make it to our 10:00am meeting. @Touma Kunjo @Marcus Krauss fyi -

- marcuskrauss@google.com 2021-01-27T23:33:29.676Z

Just scheduled iGA for tomorrow

- Deleted on 2022-07-21T23:33:29.676Z

Just scheduled iGA for tomorrow

- marcuskrauss@google.com 2021-01-27T23:33:38.154Z

Thanks, Timir, we'll cover

- Deleted on 2022-07-21T23:33:38.154Z

Thanks, Timir, we'll cover

- touma@google.com 2021-01-27T23:44:11.397Z

thanks @Timir Shah !

- Deleted on 2022-07-21T23:44:11.397Z

thanks @Timir Shah !

- marcuskrauss@google.com 2021-01-28T16:52:28.946Z

As a reminder, these teams today filled out the older set of questions, so please make sure to include newer ones during the interview process and we can capture responses in the notes

- Deleted on 2022-07-22T16:52:28.946Z

As a reminder, these teams today filled out the older set of questions, so please make sure to include newer ones during the interview process and we can capture responses in the notes

- srireddy@google.com 2021-01-28T16:56:52.992Z

@Dan Ardelean will you drive the first one since christophe cannot make it?

- Deleted on 2022-07-22T16:56:52.992Z

@Dan Ardelean will you drive the first one since christophe cannot make it?

- marcuskrauss@google.com 2021-01-28T16:58:38.995Z

I'll take notes since Timir is out. I still think it makes sense to use the trix since we can provide context in the notes to the answers the team already provided

- Deleted on 2022-07-22T16:58:38.995Z

I'll take notes since Timir is out. I still think it makes sense to use the trix since we can provide context in the notes to the answers the team already provided

- dardelean@google.com 2021-01-28T16:59:30.016Z

Yes, I can drive. Marcus, please t-up the context

- Deleted on 2022-07-22T16:59:30.016Z

Yes, I can drive. Marcus, please t-up the context

- dardelean@google.com 2021-01-28T16:59:38.978Z

thank you!

- Deleted on 2022-07-22T16:59:38.978Z

thank you!

- srireddy@google.com 2021-01-28T17:00:00.339Z

here's the doc with updated questions and context we can use:

- https://drive.google.com/open?id=1pH_XbS6lMur18WbwpNCGvAR57aJkik-BqIIVGdJ07iM

- Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:00:00.339Z

here's the doc with updated questions and context we can use:

- https://drive.google.com/open?id=1pH_XbS6lMur18WbwpNCGvAR57aJkik-BqIIVGdJ07iM

- marcuskrauss@google.com 2021-01-28T17:00:16.821Z

thx

- Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:00:16.821Z

thx

- dardelean@google.com 2021-01-28T17:00:49.832Z

cool. btw - this group is on record

- Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:00:49.832Z

cool. btw - this group is on record

- dardelean@google.com 2021-01-28T17:01:03.377Z

we should kill it and create one that is single threaded and off the record

- Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:01:03.377Z

we should kill it and create one that is single threaded and off the record

- srireddy@google.com 2021-01-28T17:01:40.628Z

not sure why - yes good pt!

- Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:01:40.628Z

not sure why - yes good pt!

- dardelean@google.com 2021-01-28T17:23:43.639Z

ok, cool, I am going to use the main room until the off record chat is created.

- Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:23:43.639Z

ok, cool, I am going to use the main room until the off record chat is created.

- srireddy@google.com 2021-01-28T17:23:51.964Z

sg

- Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:23:51.964Z

sg

- ccombette@google.com 2021-01-28T17:36:18.763Z

is the classroom meeting not happening?

- Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:36:18.763Z

is the classroom meeting not happening?

- srireddy@google.com 2021-01-28T17:36:26.380Z

nope

- Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:36:26.380Z

nope

- ccombette@google.com 2021-01-28T17:36:33.538Z

ah ok

- Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:36:33.538Z

ah ok

- ccombette@google.com 2021-01-28T17:36:37.428Z

I'll drop then

- Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:36:37.428Z

I'll drop then

- vitalyr@google.com 2021-01-28T17:36:39.960Z

already happened in a way

- Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:36:39.960Z

already happened in a way

- vitalyr@google.com 2021-01-28T17:36:49.588Z

see the main chat about Workspace apps

- Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:36:49.588Z

see the main chat about Workspace apps

- marcuskrauss@google.com 2021-01-28T17:41:54.385Z

I just pinged Alex, and his response was "Classroom is a different org than Workspace, and hasn't been included at all up to this point in any of our efforts"

- Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:41:54.385Z

I just pinged Alex, and his response was "Classroom is a different org than Workspace, and hasn't been included at all up to this point in any of our efforts"

- vitalyr@google.com 2021-01-28T17:42:30.070Z

oh

- Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:42:30.070Z

oh

- marcuskrauss@google.com 2021-01-28T17:43:00.060Z

let me try and message the invite to get people back on

- Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:43:00.060Z

let me try and message the invite to get people back on

- dardelean@google.com 2021-01-28T17:43:14.957Z

that's not a very good answer

- Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:43:14.957Z

that's not a very good answer

- dardelean@google.com 2021-01-28T17:43:25.120Z

Marcus, let me know if you need help relaying that

• Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:43:25.120Z

Marcus, let me know if you need help relaying that

• vitalyr@google.com 2021-01-28T17:43:37.188Z

maybe the right thing is for Alex to include this in Workspace?

• Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:43:37.188Z

maybe the right thing is for Alex to include this in Workspace?

• vitalyr@google.com 2021-01-28T17:43:41.181Z

Dan, wdyt?

• Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:43:41.181Z

Dan, wdyt?

• dardelean@google.com 2021-01-28T17:43:50.356Z

1) this is a code red and everyone in the company needs to pitch in and do whatever they can to make this happen

• Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:43:50.356Z

1) this is a code red and everyone in the company needs to pitch in and do whatever they can to make this happen

• dardelean@google.com 2021-01-28T17:44:39.010Z

2) Classroom even though in a different PA, used to be in Workspace a few months ago, so their systems are definitely resembling workspace and in fact relying on workspace

• Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:44:39.010Z

2) Classroom even though in a different PA, used to be in Workspace a few months ago, so their systems are definitely resembling workspace and in fact relying on workspace

• srireddy@google.com 2021-01-28T17:44:40.406Z

+1 to vitality

• Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:44:40.406Z

+1 to vitality

• marcuskrauss@google.com 2021-01-28T17:45:08.877Z

OK, let me give it a shot with him again

• Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:45:08.877Z

OK, let me give it a shot with him again

• dardelean@google.com 2021-01-28T17:45:09.474Z

yes, I am just providing the arguments/motivation to give to Alex H.

• Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:45:09.474Z

yes, I am just providing the arguments/motivation to give to Alex H.

• dardelean@google.com 2021-01-28T17:46:03.569Z

3) the central code red team is stretched thin, so to increase productivity and given the closeness of Classroom to Workspace, we are asking that they take and run the Classroom audit

• Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:46:03.569Z

3) the central code red team is stretched thin, so to increase productivity and given the closeness of Classroom to Workspace, we are asking that they take and run the Classroom audit

- **dardelean@google.com** 2021-01-28T17:46:51.611Z

sg, Marcus, please relay these 3 points to Alex

- **Deleted on**2022-07-22T17:46:51.611Z

sg, Marcus, please relay these 3 points to Alex

- **dardelean@google.com** 2021-01-28T17:47:25.960Z

who is in charge with creating this room? I really feel super uncomfortable us continuing this on the record

- **Deleted on**2022-07-22T17:47:25.960Z

who is in charge with creating this room? I really feel super uncomfortable us continuing this on the record

- **touma@google.com** 2021-01-28T17:49:40.829Z

history is off for me. maybe someone turned it off after dan's comment?

- **Deleted on**2022-07-22T17:49:40.829Z

history is off for me. maybe someone turned it off after dan's comment?

- **dardelean@google.com** 2021-01-28T17:53:05.559Z

@Touma Kunjo where do you see history off for this room? In principle, threaded rooms cannot have history off because of how they are implemented.

- **Deleted on**2022-07-22T17:53:05.559Z

@Touma Kunjo where do you see history off for this room? In principle, threaded rooms cannot have history off because of how they are implemented.

- **touma@google.com** 2021-01-28T17:56:15.316Z

○ Screen Shot 2021-01-28 at 9.39.34 AM.png

- **Deleted on**2022-07-22T17:56:15.316Z

○ Screen Shot 2021-01-28 at 9.39.34 AM.png

- **touma@google.com** 2021-01-28T17:56:26.940Z

before the name changed.

- **Deleted on**2022-07-22T17:56:26.940Z

before the name changed.

- **touma@google.com** 2021-01-28T17:56:31.660Z

so you may be right

- **Deleted on**2022-07-22T17:56:31.660Z

so you may be right

- **touma@google.com** 2021-01-28T17:56:53.355Z

im gonna create a new room and kill this one

- **Deleted on**2022-07-22T17:56:53.355Z

im gonna create a new room and kill this one

- **touma@google.com** 2021-01-28T17:56:59.506Z

pls give me 15-20 mins

- **Deleted on**2022-07-22T17:56:59.506Z

pls give me 15-20 mins

- **dardelean@google.com** 2021-01-28T17:57:19.593Z

sorry I copied everyone into a new room

- Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:57:19.593Z

sorry I copied everyone into a new room

- touma@google.com 2021-01-28T17:57:39.835Z

@Sri Reddy can you open the play audit meeting? @Timir Shah will take notes. and marcus can't join

- Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:57:39.835Z

@Sri Reddy can you open the play audit meeting? @Timir Shah will take notes. and marcus can't join

- srireddy@google.com 2021-01-28T17:57:45.844Z

thanks dan!

- Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:57:45.844Z

thanks dan!

- srireddy@google.com 2021-01-28T17:57:49.112Z

sure will do

- Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:57:49.112Z

sure will do

- touma@google.com 2021-01-28T17:58:04.302Z

and i have to prep other leads for 11am apple call.

- Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:58:04.302Z

and i have to prep other leads for 11am apple call.

- touma@google.com 2021-01-28T17:58:06.438Z

thanks so much!

- Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:58:06.438Z

thanks so much!

- dardelean@google.com 2021-01-28T17:58:22.857Z

let's stop using this one

- Deleted on 2022-07-22T17:58:22.857Z

let's stop using this one

Exhibit 4M

Custodian: Adam Juda; Jerry Dischler; Prabhakar Raghavan;
Rany Ng; Vidhya Srinivasan

Witness: Jerry Dischler

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-018491736

Message

From: pragh@google.com [pragh@google.com]
Sent: 1/27/2021 5:38:56 PM
To: tlazarus@google.com; dromain@google.com; schacon@google.com; gasca@google.com; juda@google.com; atarbusk@google.com; vids@google.com; pragh@google.com; jboortz@google.com; crhyu@google.com; kirjner@google.com; cathyedwards@google.com; jbx@google.com; srireddy@google.com; ehamon@google.com; rlipscumb@google.com; rany@google.com; nicholas@google.com; taneja@google.com; jdischler@google.com
Subject: gOcTfQAAAAE-2021.01.27

- **pragh@google.com** 2021-01-27T17:38:56.017Z

related to this apple privacy discussion, from today's NYT: "The result is that the data practices of Apple's apps are less upfront. If Apple wants to lead the privacy conversation, it can set a better example by making language clearer — and its labeling program less self-serving. When I asked why all apps shouldn't be held to the same standards, Apple did not address the issue further."

- **cathyedwards@google.com** 2021-01-27T17:40:11.298Z

I worry that this will be like Apple and China - they are just better at handling this press (and their employees) than we are so won't be so drawn into an ongoing story

- **pragh@google.com** 2021-01-27T17:40:38.624Z

well then we just need to get a lot better

- **pragh@google.com** 2021-01-27T17:47:11.796Z

ugh pl stop this chat, for some reason History is on

Exhibit 4N

Custodian: Vip Andleigh

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-019389207

Message

From: dallsopp@google.com [dallsopp@google.com]
Sent: 2/10/2021 9:46:44 PM
To: dallsopp@google.com; nazli@google.com; hharding@google.com; vip@google.com; agraja@google.com; crhyu@google.com
Subject: AAAAxuS4Mml-ChOrZRdJue8
Attachments: cc90401d-35fd-4269-862f-5bc7788404fe.jpg

- **dallsopp@google.com** 2021-02-10T21:46:44.875Z

What up squad.

- **nazli@google.com** 2021-02-10T21:50:01.972Z

sup!

- **nazli@google.com** 2021-02-10T21:50:05.738Z

sorry I missed the sync today

- **dallsopp@google.com** 2021-02-10T21:50:40.709Z

We are setting up this chat room to keep the info flowing between up.

- **hharding@google.com** 2021-02-10T21:51:04.886Z

New phone who dis?

- cc90401d-35fd-4269-862f-5bc7788404fe.jpg

- **dallsopp@google.com** 2021-02-10T21:51:48.837Z

Only items that can be discussed via chat. if anything substantial i'll try to link up live. Henry.. if CoS chat room.

- **Updated on**2021-02-10T21:51:57.166Z

Only items that can be discussed via chat. if anything substantial i'll try to link up live. Henry.. its CoS chat room.

- **hharding@google.com** 2021-02-10T21:54:17.860Z

And also a fun meme chat room, if I have anything to say about it

- **dallsopp@google.com** 2021-02-10T21:54:43.965Z

okay got it... u were joking (smile).

- **nazli@google.com** 2021-02-10T21:54:49.403Z

LOLZ

- **dallsopp@google.com** 2021-02-10T21:54:56.729Z

Note we are likely to see a change in Jerry meeting cadences and audiences

- **dallsopp@google.com** 2021-02-10T21:55:03.858Z

first tibit to share

- **vip@google.com** 2021-02-10T21:56:09.310Z

can we turn on history for this? feel like there might be stuff to refer back to

- **dallsopp@google.com** 2021-02-10T21:56:21.008Z

Instead of a VP meeting, we'll like see a Jerry +2 meeting which will address challenges like UX being under leveled.

- **vip@google.com** 2021-02-10T21:57:18.470Z

also, Henry has already dished up 1 amazing meme, and that should not be forgotten

- **dallsopp@google.com** 2021-02-10T21:57:32.850Z

Can we also keep the info confidential to this group? Like what i just shared has not been shared yet with Jerry's leads. Its something I am working with Suzanne on.

- **dallsopp@google.com** 2021-02-10T21:57:43.229Z

I NEVER use memes.....

- **vip@google.com** 2021-02-10T21:59:28.472Z

lets keep confi, we can also turn off history. if i see something important, i'll note it down somewhere

- **vip@google.com** 2021-02-10T21:59:59.990Z

i have scrolled up 3 times to see Henry's meme over and over.

- **dallsopp@google.com** 2021-02-10T22:00:07.333Z

I also dont know how to turn history on...

- **vip@google.com** 2021-02-10T22:03:09.080Z

Meet/Chat is even harder to use than Zoom: <https://youtu.be/9f9cDBpnkaU>

- <https://youtu.be/9f9cDBpnkaU>

- <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=9f9cDBpnkaU>

- **vip@google.com** 2021-02-10T22:03:33.977Z

(actual video from a Texas courtroom hearing over zoom)

- **agraja@google.com** 2021-02-10T22:06:22.242Z

@Vip Andleigh that video made my day

- **agraja@google.com** 2021-02-10T22:06:45.689Z

Also, thanks for the heads up, Dale. will keep confidential.

- **crhyu@google.com** 2021-02-10T22:07:30.551Z

yes, ack on confidential and thx for sharing

- **dallsopp@google.com** 2021-02-10T23:16:04.691Z

yo.. that cat video was HILARIOUS!

- **crhyu@google.com** 2021-02-10T23:19:22.232Z

"recording of this video is prohibiited"

- **dallsopp@google.com** 2021-02-11T01:43:12.161Z

https://docs.google.com/presentation/d/1kG1CYAotgeV-NGwB3ZWIFT-Z8cobOnNBqEAGzAfeHBM/edit#slide=id.gbb0c393bc6_0_0

- https://docs.google.com/presentation/d/1kG1CYAotgeV-NGwB3ZWIFT-Z8cobOnNBqEAGzAfeHBM/edit#slide=id.gbb0c393bc6_0_0

- <https://drive.google.com/open?id=1kG1CYAotgeV-NGwB3ZWIFT-Z8cobOnNBqEAGzAfeHBM>

- **dallsopp@google.com** 2021-02-11T01:46:09.553Z

Proposal for rebooting Planning, starting by bold objectives outline by team. Next step is fleshing out headwinds, using Finance "risk Log" as a starting point. I'll share w/ this group once I have it.

- **crhyu@google.com** 2021-02-11T15:58:36.668Z

Thanks Dale this is really helpful to see. Is it final that APSO is moving to Q2? Just thinking how that impacts PAG strategy summits.

- **dallsopp@google.com** 2021-02-11T16:12:15.008Z

not final. will respond shortly. closing meeting

Exhibit 40

Custodian: Roshan Khan

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-011693260

Message

From: Madan Ankapura [mankapura@google.com]
Sent: 3/5/2021 12:29:22 PM
To: Roshan Khan [roshank@google.com]

- **Madan Ankapura, 2021-03-05 04:29:22**

yes -> homecontrols .. one legit use that I wanna to see is garage door openers

- **Madan Ankapura, 2021-03-05 07:20:44**

re : 3p app stores
I responded to your email .. one Q I didn't write in the email was .. eng ownership of this .. I think this is a distraction to jorge (IMO) and doesn't directly align with the car app lib work .. this work is better off taken up by the framework team (ie. David and his team) and we can tee it for Q2 - wdyt ?

- **Roshan Khan, 2021-03-05 07:21:19**

Let's figure our position then we can figure out who does the work. Unclear to me best place

- **Roshan Khan, 2021-03-05 07:22:43**

Can you turn history off

- **Roshan Khan, 2021-03-05 07:22:53**

Otherwise let's chat in Vcs

Exhibit 4P

Custodian: Aparna Pappu; Jim Giles

Witness: Aparna Pappu; Jim Giles

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-010777654

Trial Exhibit No.: PTX1033

Message

From: eruvalcaba@google.com [eruvalcaba@google.com]
Sent: 6/10/2021 5:09:28 PM
To: eruvalcaba@google.com; asweintraub@google.com; bcal@google.com; hsenger@google.com; mchasan@google.com; madhumoorthy@google.com; bryanv@google.com; sophiafaraj@google.com; jimgiles@google.com; arorasarthak@google.com; mulrich@google.com; azarek@google.com; lakshmanans@google.com; apappu@google.com; mattwolf@google.com; shaudy@google.com; argv@google.com
Subject: AAAAZgacNcQ-MBI-FLAT:2021-06-10T04:14:35.511327

- **eruvalcaba@google.com** 2021-06-10T17:09:28.572Z

Updated room membership.

- **Deleted on**2022-12-02T17:09:28.572Z

Updated room membership.

- **eruvalcaba@google.com** 2021-06-10T17:31:52.296Z

Updated room membership.

- **Deleted on**2022-12-02T17:31:52.296Z

Updated room membership.

- **asweintraub@google.com** 2021-06-10T17:43:19.734Z

Updated room membership.

- **Deleted on**2022-12-02T17:43:19.734Z

Updated room membership.

- **bcal@google.com** 2021-06-10T17:58:21.595Z

Updated room membership.

- **Deleted on**2022-12-02T17:58:21.595Z

Updated room membership.

- **hsenger@google.com** 2021-06-10T18:16:31.367Z

Updated room membership.

- **Deleted on**2022-12-02T18:16:31.367Z

Updated room membership.

- **mchasan@google.com** 2021-06-10T20:12:50.353Z

Updated room membership.

- **Deleted on**2022-12-02T20:12:50.353Z

Updated room membership.

- **madhumoorthy@google.com** 2021-06-10T21:45:25.209Z

Updated room membership.

- **Deleted on**2022-12-02T21:45:25.209Z

Updated room membership.

- **bryanv@google.com** 2021-06-10T22:42:09.166Z

Updated room membership.

- **Deleted on**2022-12-02T22:42:09.166Z

Updated room membership.

- **sophiafaraj@google.com** 2021-06-10T23:13:30.302Z

Updated room membership.

- **Deleted on**2022-12-02T23:13:30.302Z

Updated room membership.

- **bcal@google.com** 2021-06-10T23:14:35.511Z

@Sophia Faraj, I think it would be helpful to engage your APAC colleague, in the sense our notification sync and communication decision will likely be tomorrow (pending eng work), and this might be a necessary step anyway. (If that is something you'd rather do tomorrow during normal hours, that works.)

We have AIM colleagues in BLR/ZUR are managing the incident during EMEA/APAC hours.

- **Deleted on**2022-12-02T23:14:35.511Z

@Sophia Faraj, I think it would be helpful to engage your APAC colleague, in the sense our notification sync and communication decision will likely be tomorrow (pending eng work), and this might be a necessary step anyway. (If that is something you'd rather do tomorrow during normal hours, that works.)

We have AIM colleagues in BLR/ZUR are managing the incident during EMEA/APAC hours.

- **jimgiles@google.com** 2021-06-10T23:18:51.257Z

Updated room membership.

- **Deleted on**2022-12-02T23:18:51.257Z

Updated room membership.

- **sophiafaraj@google.com** 2021-06-10T23:19:32.528Z

I had a sync with @Amith Gopinath my IEM counterpart, he has awareness of this issue in order to monitor if there is the notification confirmation made, otherwise I can take this up tomorrow.

- **Deleted on**2022-12-02T23:19:32.528Z

I had a sync with @Amith Gopinath my IEM counterpart, he has awareness of this issue in order to monitor if there is the notification confirmation made, otherwise I can take this up tomorrow.

- **arorasarthak@google.com** 2021-06-10T23:23:27.808Z

@Tony Scelfo let's use http://scripts/script_60._c13d04_0000_234b_81c6_94eb2c0cf8c4 since we have too many scripts going around. We'll only update that once we have confidence in the query yielding expected results

- http://scripts/script_60._c13d04_0000_234b_81c6_94eb2c0cf8c4

- **Deleted on**2022-12-02T23:23:27.808Z

@Tony Scelfo let's use http://scripts/script_60._c13d04_0000_234b_81c6_94eb2c0cf8c4 since we have too many scripts going around. We'll only update that once we have confidence in the query yielding expected results

- http://scripts/script_60._c13d04_0000_234b_81c6_94eb2c0cf8c4

- **sophiafaraj@google.com** 2021-06-10T23:32:39.332Z

Also just want to FYI -- per our engagement process IEM engagement ends after 6 pm pt. APAC does have awareness and If we have not reached a decision point by this time then I will plan on taking it up during AMER business hours ☺

- **Deleted on**2022-12-02T23:32:39.332Z

Also just want to FYI -- per our engagement process IEM engagement ends after 6 pm pt. APAC does have awareness and If we have not reached a decision point by this time then I will plan on taking it up during AMER business hours ☺

- **jimgiles@google.com** 2021-06-10T23:43:32.874Z

Updated room membership.

- **Deleted on**2022-12-02T23:43:32.874Z

Updated room membership.

- **madhumoorthy@google.com** 2021-06-10T23:58:12.102Z

I have got approval to change the retention from 45days to 55 days(max)

(link:<https://logsfrontdoor.corp.google.com/#proposal/madhumoorthy.148382005>)

- <https://logsfrontdoor.corp.google.com/#proposal/madhumoorthy.148382005>

- **Deleted on**2022-12-02T23:58:12.102Z

I have got approval to change the retention from 45days to 55 days(max)

(link:<https://logsfrontdoor.corp.google.com/#proposal/madhumoorthy.148382005>)

- <https://logsfrontdoor.corp.google.com/#proposal/madhumoorthy.148382005>

- **mulrich@google.com** 2021-06-10T23:59:08.968Z

Updated room membership.

- **Deleted on**2022-12-02T23:59:08.968Z

Updated room membership.

- **jimgiles@google.com** 2021-06-10T23:59:39.193Z

Thanks Madhu

- **Deleted on**2022-12-02T23:59:39.193Z

Thanks Madhu

- **azarek@google.com** 2021-06-11T00:20:47.538Z

Updated room membership.

- **Deleted on**2022-12-03T00:20:47.538Z

Updated room membership.

- **jimgiles@google.com** 2021-06-11T00:31:21.138Z

Updated room membership.

- **Deleted on**2022-12-03T00:31:21.138Z

Updated room membership.

- **lakshmanans@google.com** 2021-06-11T00:32:08.232Z

Updated room membership.

- **Deleted on**2022-12-03T00:32:08.232Z

Updated room membership.

- **mchasan@google.com** 2021-06-11T00:41:39.289Z

Please keep history off on this legally sensitive chat room

- **Deleted on**2022-12-03T00:41:39.289Z

Please keep history off on this legally sensitive chat room

- **apappu@google.com** 2021-06-11T00:45:30.150Z
@Mike Chasan who all have we debriefed in legal?
- **Deleted on**2022-12-03T00:45:30.150Z
@Mike Chasan who all have we debriefed in legal?
- **bcal@google.com** 2021-06-11T00:46:29.213Z
Updated room membership.
- **Deleted on**2022-12-03T00:46:29.213Z
Updated room membership.
- **mattwolf@google.com** 2021-06-11T01:45:32.483Z
Updated room membership.
- **Deleted on**2022-12-03T01:45:32.483Z
Updated room membership.
- **apappu@google.com** 2021-06-11T03:56:29.977Z
Updated room membership.
- **Deleted on**2022-12-03T03:56:29.977Z
Updated room membership.
- **apappu@google.com** 2021-06-11T03:56:43.208Z
Updated room membership.
- **Deleted on**2022-12-03T03:56:43.208Z
Updated room membership.
- **apappu@google.com** 2021-06-11T03:56:54.145Z
Updated room membership.
- **Deleted on**2022-12-03T03:56:54.145Z
Updated room membership.
- **shaudy@google.com** 2021-06-11T03:56:58.347Z
Updated room membership.
- **Deleted on**2022-12-03T03:56:58.347Z
Updated room membership.
- **apappu@google.com** 2021-06-11T03:57:09.088Z
Updated room membership.
- **Deleted on**2022-12-03T03:57:09.088Z
Updated room membership.
- **apappu@google.com** 2021-06-11T03:57:21.055Z
Updated room membership.
- **Deleted on**2022-12-03T03:57:21.055Z
Updated room membership.
- **argv@google.com** 2021-06-11T04:45:04.135Z
Updated room membership.

- **Deleted on**2022-12-03T04:45:04.135Z

Updated room membership.

- **apappu@google.com** 2021-06-11T04:53:02.012Z

Updated room membership.

- **Deleted on**2022-12-03T04:53:02.012Z

Updated room membership.

- **madhumoorthy@google.com** 2021-06-11T05:24:17.581Z

Updated room membership.

- **Deleted on**2022-12-03T05:24:17.581Z

Updated room membership.

Exhibit 4Q

Custodian: Sundar Pichai

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-B-004073824

Message

From: sundar@google.com [sundar@google.com]
Sent: 10/12/2021 4:53:16 AM
To: sundar@google.com; emilysinger@google.com
Subject: AAAARxi46TM-MBI-THREADED:SBgcVRDjcBQ%%2021-10-11T09:53:16.093967

sundar@google.com October 12, 2021 at 4:53:16 AM UTC

Need the link for my leaders circle tomorrow

Deleted on April 5, 2023 at 4:53:16 AM UTC

Need the link for my leaders circle tomorrow

sundar@google.com October 12, 2021 at 4:53:28 AM UTC

also can we change the setting of this group to history off

Deleted on October 12, 2021 at 4:53:37 AM UTC

also can we change the setting of this group to history off

sundar@google.com October 12, 2021 at 4:53:29 AM UTC

thanks

Deleted on April 5, 2023 at 4:53:29 AM UTC

thanks

emilysinger@google.com October 12, 2021 at 4:53:40 AM UTC

Sure: here is link...

Deleted on April 5, 2023 at 4:53:40 AM UTC

Sure: here is link...

emilysinger@google.com October 12, 2021 at 4:53:45 AM UTC

https://docs.google.com/document/d/16lxXL_k0ok6NhDX0nTZw-tr76LZpgODBP_CfqTdotTs/edit?resourcekey=0-CNmvgHKQGULhTywnpcXgg
https://drive.google.com/open?id=16lxXL_k0ok6NhDX0nTZw-tr76LZpgODBP_CfqTdotTs
https://docs.google.com/document/d/16lxXL_k0ok6NhDX0nTZw-tr76LZpgODBP_CfqTdotTs/edit?resourcekey=0-CNmvgHKQGULhTywnpcXgg

Deleted on April 5, 2023 at 4:53:45 AM UTC

https://docs.google.com/document/d/16lxXL_k0ok6NhDX0nTZw-tr76LZpgODBP_CfqTdotTs/edit?resourcekey=0-CNmvgHKQGULhTywnpcXgg
https://drive.google.com/open?id=16lxXL_k0ok6NhDX0nTZw-tr76LZpgODBP_CfqTdotTs
https://docs.google.com/document/d/16lxXL_k0ok6NhDX0nTZw-tr76LZpgODBP_CfqTdotTs/edit?resourcekey=0-CNmvgHKQGULhTywnpcXgg

sundar@google.com October 12, 2021 at 4:55:19 AM UTC

thanks

Deleted on April 5, 2023 at 4:55:19 AM UTC

thanks

sundar@google.com October 12, 2021 at 5:17:38 AM UTC

the third question is a bit of a mess

Deleted on April 5, 2023 at 5:17:38 AM UTC

the third question is a bit of a mess

sundar@google.com October 12, 2021 at 5:17:58 AM UTC

not fully clear - as it covers a lot and long meandering answer which not clear too

Deleted on April 5, 2023 at 5:17:58 AM UTC

not fully clear - as it covers a lot and long meandering answer which not clear too

sundar@google.com October 12, 2021 at 5:18:11 AM UTC

am talking about google apps , building for companies, future of work etc

Deleted on April 5, 2023 at 5:18:11 AM UTC

am talking about google apps , building for companies, future of work etc

sundar@google.com October 12, 2021 at 5:18:17 AM UTC

the other three are good

Deleted on April 5, 2023 at 5:18:17 AM UTC

the other three are good

emilysinger@google.com October 12, 2021 at 5:18:25 AM UTC

Ok will take a look and try to restructure to make cleare

Deleted on April 5, 2023 at 5:18:25 AM UTC

Ok will take a look and try to restructure to make cleare

emilysinger@google.com October 12, 2021 at 5:18:27 AM UTC

r

Deleted on April 5, 2023 at 5:18:27 AM UTC

r

emilysinger@google.com October 12, 2021 at 5:59:17 AM UTC

I simplified the answer for Q # 3 considerably. Just two parts to it now, both of which will be familiar themes. Sorry it took a bit to get there.

Deleted on April 5, 2023 at 5:59:17 AM UTC

I simplified the answer for Q # 3 considerably. Just two parts to it now, both of which will be familiar themes. Sorry it took a bit to get there.

sundar@google.com October 12, 2021 at 6:09:06 AM UTC

Thanks!

Deleted on April 5, 2023 at 6:09:06 AM UTC

Thanks!

Exhibit 4R

Custodian: Woojin Kim

Witness: Woojin Kim

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-008836562

Message

From: gomes@google.com [gomes@google.com]
Sent: 11/4/2021 4:38:36 PM
To: gomes@google.com; woojink@google.com
Subject: AAAA2pix6vU-MBI-THREADED:MExf47Moeo4%%2021-11-03T21:38:36.693711

- **gomes@google.com** 2021-11-04T16:38:36.693Z

Ok - I created the space! Let's see what this new fanciness offers

- **woojink@google.com** 2021-11-04T16:39:15.556Z

can you turn off history?

- **woojink@google.com** 2021-11-04T16:39:40.559Z

and could you add katie kurtz pls

- **gomes@google.com** 2021-11-04T16:50:51.761Z

Added Katie - if you have threading, then history is on, so this is basically like email.

Exhibit 4S

Custodian: Danielle Romain

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-010366478

Trial Exhibit No.: PTX1797

Message

From: yvettehc@google.com [yvettehc@google.com]
Sent: 11/10/2021 6:15:58 PM
To: yvettehc@google.com; domain@google.com
Subject: AAAAAiEErHE-MBI-FLAT:2021-11-09T23:15:58.284495

- **yvettehc@google.com** 2021-11-10T18:15:58.284Z

ok for me to keep history on here? need to keep some info for memory purposes 😊

- **domain@google.com** 2021-11-10T18:34:34.134Z

Yvette, unfortunately, I'm not supportive of turning history on. The discussion that started this thread gets into legal and potentially competitive territory, which I'd like to be conscientious of having under privilege. So that you're aware, when history is on, it's discoverable. Sometimes that's totally fine but I'd like to stick to the default of history off. Thanks

Exhibit 4T

Custodian: Adam Juda

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-B-004468047

Message

From: wendyklogan@google.com [wendyklogan@google.com]
Sent: 11/17/2021 1:16:39 AM
To: wendyklogan@google.com; aysundemircan@google.com; sunitav@google.com; iljic@google.com; juda@google.com
Subject: AAAASdp5bsM-MBI-THREADED:n2sQpiPWcRM%%2021-11-16T06:16:39.796319

wendyklogan@google.com November 17, 2021 at 1:16:39 AM UTC

Adding Aysun, who is excited to drive and coordinate this effort from a Business Strategy perspective. Welcome

Deleted on May 11, 2023 at 1:16:39 AM UTC

Adding Aysun, who is excited to drive and coordinate this effort from a Business Strategy perspective. Welcome

aysundemircan@google.com November 17, 2021 at 1:22:11 AM UTC

Thank you, Wendy! Team - I am super excited to be part of this effort!!

Deleted on May 11, 2023 at 1:22:11 AM UTC

Thank you, Wendy! Team - I am super excited to be part of this effort!!

aysundemircan@google.com November 17, 2021 at 1:22:42 AM UTC

p.s. I was thinking about what we can do in the space even earlier this year and wondering who / which team I could reach out to -- and here I am 😊

Deleted on May 11, 2023 at 1:22:42 AM UTC

p.s. I was thinking about what we can do in the space even earlier this year and wondering who / which team I could reach out to -- and here I am 😊

sunitav@google.com November 17, 2021 at 2:06:30 AM UTC

Great to have you involved!

Deleted on May 11, 2023 at 2:06:30 AM UTC

Great to have you involved!

iljic@google.com November 17, 2021 at 3:24:29 AM UTC

Welcome Aysun! We have our work cut out for us, should be fun! :-)

Deleted on May 11, 2023 at 3:24:29 AM UTC

Welcome Aysun! We have our work cut out for us, should be fun! :-)

juda@google.com November 17, 2021 at 2:43:40 PM UTC

What is the history status of this group?

Deleted on May 11, 2023 at 2:43:40 PM UTC

What is the history status of this group?

wendyklogan@google.com November 17, 2021 at 8:33:57 PM UTC

Given it's a thread chat room, we cannot turn history off and chat retention is 18 months.

<https://support.google.com/info-gov/answer/9366391>

<https://support.google.com/info-gov/answer/9366391>

Deleted on May 11, 2023 at 8:33:57 PM UTC

Given it's a thread chat room, we cannot turn history off and chat retention is 18 months.

<https://support.google.com/info-gov/answer/9366391>

<https://support.google.com/info-gov/answer/9366391>

wendyklogan@google.com November 17, 2021 at 8:34:34 PM UTC

We can pivot to group chat with history off -- or --- keep the current setup and only reserve this space for non-sensitive discussions

Updated on November 17, 2021 at 8:34:46 PM UTC

We can pivot to group chat with history off -- or --- keep the current setup and reserve this space for non-sensitive discussions

Updated on November 17, 2021 at 8:34:58 PM UTC

We can pivot to group non-threaded chat with history off -- or --- keep the current setup and reserve this space for non-sensitive discussions

Deleted on May 11, 2023 at 8:34:34 PM UTC

We can pivot to group non-threaded chat with history off -- or --- keep the current setup and reserve this space for non-sensitive discussions

juda@google.com November 17, 2021 at 8:38:27 PM UTC

My preference is history off

Deleted on May 11, 2023 at 8:38:27 PM UTC

My preference is history off

wendyklogan@google.com November 17, 2021 at 9:07:09 PM UTC

sounds good. Will pivot to Google Chat vs. Google Spaces

Deleted on May 11, 2023 at 9:07:09 PM UTC

sounds good. Will pivot to Google Chat vs. Google Spaces

Exhibit 4U

Custodian: Martin Pal

Witness: Martin Pal

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-011236786

Message

From: cilvento@google.com [cilvento@google.com]
Sent: 12/15/2021 8:20:47 PM
To: cilvento@google.com; mpal@google.com; tris@google.com
Subject: AAAAEsnvUs0-MBI-FLAT:2021-12-15T01:36:59.138767

cilvento@google.com December 15, 2021 at 8:20:47 PM UTC

Updated room membership.

Deleted on June 8, 2023 at 8:20:47 PM UTC

Updated room membership.

mpal@google.com December 15, 2021 at 8:36:59 PM UTC

Hope it's OK to have chat history on

Deleted on June 8, 2023 at 8:36:59 PM UTC

Hope it's OK to have chat history on

mpal@google.com December 15, 2021 at 8:37:26 PM UTC

Would it also make sense to set up a mailing list? Locked down, probably

Deleted on June 8, 2023 at 8:37:26 PM UTC

Would it also make sense to set up a mailing list? Locked down, probably

cilvento@google.com December 15, 2021 at 8:38:34 PM UTC

Sure!

Deleted on June 8, 2023 at 8:38:34 PM UTC

Sure!

tris@google.com December 15, 2021 at 9:13:26 PM UTC

We want chat history on? I would generally prefer for us to keep history off. Is there a strong reason to keep this on?

Deleted on June 8, 2023 at 9:13:26 PM UTC

We want chat history on? I would generally prefer for us to keep history off. Is there a strong reason to keep this on?

cilvento@google.com December 15, 2021 at 9:32:31 PM UTC

I think history is on at this point

Deleted on June 8, 2023 at 9:32:31 PM UTC

I think history is on at this point

cilvento@google.com December 15, 2021 at 9:32:40 PM UTC

But we'll turn it off now as discussed

Deleted on June 8, 2023 at 9:32:40 PM UTC

But we'll turn it off now as discussed

mpal@google.com December 15, 2021 at 9:32:40 PM UTC

let's turn it off then

Deleted on June 8, 2023 at 9:32:40 PM UTC

let's turn it off then

Exhibit 4V

Custodian: Vip Andleigh

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-012246761

Message

From: alexsunm@google.com [alexsunm@google.com]
Sent: 2/1/2022 2:37:24 PM
To: alexsunm@google.com; dallsopp@google.com; hharding@google.com; tarunsingh@google.com; kevinmccaffrey@google.com; ndanziger@google.com; wenjiesun@google.com; jorgeluthe@google.com; lissaseem@google.com; wendyklogan@google.com; atarbusk@google.com; kimlydia@google.com; vip@google.com; justinungson@google.com; dyc@google.com; brownadam@google.com; meigs@google.com; craigma@google.com
Subject: AAAAx8WH14w-MBI-FLAT:2022-01-31T19:37:24.271775

- **alexsunm@google.com** 2022-02-01T14:37:24.271Z

Happy Lunar new year team!! It's the year of 🐉 and wish you a roaring new year!!! When I grew up in China we always get together with extended family and parents / grandparents would give us money in red envelopes (it's all digital now!!) We ate a lot of dumplings and played with firecrackers (I'm happy to still have all my fingers). Hope everyone have good fortune and health!

- **dallsopp@google.com** 2022-02-01T14:37:44.099Z

hahahahaha

- **dallsopp@google.com** 2022-02-01T14:38:08.414Z

thanks Alex! Celebrate!

- **hharding@google.com** 2022-02-01T14:38:28.599Z

Thanks Alex. I am definitely accepting money, in envelopes or otherwise!

- **dallsopp@google.com** 2022-02-01T14:39:21.785Z

but only from people with all digits?

- **hharding@google.com** 2022-02-01T14:40:46.198Z

... literally everyone should send me money, digit-status does not matter

- **tarunsingh@google.com** 2022-02-01T15:06:20.256Z

Henry's venmo is @singhtarun in case anyone didn't have it

- **tarunsingh@google.com** 2022-02-01T15:06:33.373Z

Happy new year Alex

- **dallsopp@google.com** 2022-02-01T15:07:05.443Z

hahahahahahah

- **kevinmccaffrey@google.com** 2022-02-01T15:40:46.531Z

happy new year

- **ndanziger@google.com** 2022-02-01T15:44:13.766Z

happy new year!

- **wenjiesun@google.com** 2022-02-01T16:37:31.834Z

happy lunar new year! ☐

- **jorgeluthe@google.com** 2022-02-01T16:41:56.483Z

Happy New Year!!

- **lissaseem@google.com** 2022-02-01T17:03:01.613Z

Happy New Year everyone!!

- **wendyklogan@google.com** 2022-02-01T17:37:28.412Z

I only accept and send ETH these days

- **wendyklogan@google.com** 2022-02-01T17:37:38.583Z

Happy Lunar New Year and BHM team!

- **ndanziger@google.com** 2022-02-01T17:37:48.233Z

no dogecoin?

- **atarbusk@google.com** 2022-02-01T18:27:33.635Z

Darn you, @Nick Danziger! I'm now a Wordle addict! But I just got my first solve in 2!! Wordle 227 2/6

□□□□□

□□□□□

- **jorgeluthe@google.com** 2022-02-01T18:42:39.943Z

Very impressive!

- **atarbusk@google.com** 2022-02-01T18:43:02.734Z

Thanks! Quite a bit of luck, too!

- **ndanziger@google.com** 2022-02-01T19:38:12.213Z

Second guess! Awesome!

- **kimlydia@google.com** 2022-02-02T16:40:24.301Z

A little late but... happy new year!

- **kimlydia@google.com** 2022-02-02T16:41:51.254Z

hahaha @Tarun Singh we haven't met yet (hellooo!) but started off the morning solo LOLing #venmohentry

- **ndanziger@google.com** 2022-02-02T16:52:41.192Z

on another note, is anyone else stunned that olympics coverage is starting already today?

- **tarunsingh@google.com** 2022-02-02T17:40:05.341Z

the delayed tokyo olympics definitely made it like we never stopped being in olympics mode

- **vip@google.com** 2022-02-02T18:01:35.395Z

note: until 1992, the summer+winter olympics were held in the same year. They split winter and summer after that year. and have since added snowboarding, which opened the gates to events like "slopestyle" ☺

- **tarunsingh@google.com** 2022-02-02T18:02:21.814Z

the first solo winter olympics were lillehammer right?

- **ndanziger@google.com** 2022-02-02T18:05:17.170Z

don't know the answer to that, but apparently this year they added the monobob

- **ndanziger@google.com** 2022-02-02T18:05:18.977Z

which sounds amazing

- **justinungson@google.com** 2022-02-02T18:08:23.811Z

@Tarun Singh I believe so. 1994? I remember them making a big deal about it.

- **atarbusk@google.com** 2022-02-02T18:58:33.339Z

Hey everyone! Tomorrow is our All Hands! Please head to the dory and tell us what's on your mind!

<https://dory.corp.google.com/ads-so-all-hands>

- <https://dory.corp.google.com/ads-so-all-hands>

- **alexsunm@google.com** 2022-02-02T19:06:39.024Z

Updated room membership.

- **tarunsingh@google.com** 2022-02-02T21:11:35.025Z

FB got crushed in earnings and has horrible future outlook - @Vip Andleigh would be interesting to see what headwinds they're facing that we aren't

- **tarunsingh@google.com** 2022-02-02T21:11:57.003Z

i know our YT #s missed the street expectation by a bit so I wonder if this is a headwind for all of social

- **tarunsingh@google.com** 2022-02-02T21:12:08.427Z

and how we should think about 2022 strategy for our social properties

- **ndanziger@google.com** 2022-02-02T21:12:09.569Z

or all of the metaverse...

- **vip@google.com** 2022-02-02T21:31:31.162Z

@Dan Chen is probably closer on the FB perspective

- **vip@google.com** 2022-02-02T21:33:44.206Z

holy moly. FB down 23% in afterhours. my guess is that their strategy for iOS did not pan out well (they seemed to get a really late start on their strategy there). I'd also assume engagement is weakening on the core app and hurting their cross-platform measurement products, etc.

- **dallsopp@google.com** 2022-02-02T21:34:27.185Z

Dan Chen and Vip on the same thread... is this like dejavu?

- **dyc@google.com** 2022-02-02T21:37:04.738Z

Took a quick glance at the press release. Q4 looks okay, but they appear to be guiding Q1 revenue well below consensus (5-10% below). They say it's on both pricing and impression deceleration. They are blaming a shift to Reels (lower CPM than stories and news feed) and ATT. I wonder if they are struggling on the engagement side more broadly. Let's see what they say on their earnings call...

- **vip@google.com** 2022-02-02T21:44:58.228Z

also - every year, they sandbag their guidance and over deliver through the year. so take their guidance with a grain of salt (even though the stock market does not)

- **dyc@google.com** 2022-02-02T21:50:32.109Z

They do tend to sandbag a bit... but their guide feels more below consensus than normal

- **brownadam@google.com** 2022-02-02T21:51:01.685Z

The other factor I'd throw out there is increased competition. TikTok is growing at an unreal rate and just overtook Google.com as the highest traffic domain

- <http://Google.com>

- **alexsunm@google.com** 2022-02-02T22:08:34.778Z

This is becoming a common thing now NFLX, FB and PYPL!!!

- **dyc@google.com** 2022-02-02T22:50:23.368Z

Wow, they estimate an ATT impact of \$10B in 2022

- **tarunsingh@google.com** 2022-02-02T22:51:03.473Z

they also called out what they said was "preferential treatment" for google search a few times

- **dyc@google.com** 2022-02-02T22:52:02.310Z

Which is BS because Apple deprecated cookies on web long ago

- **Updated on**2022-02-02T22:52:24.592Z

Which is BS because Apple deprecated cookies on safari long ago

- **tarunsingh@google.com** 2022-02-02T22:53:16.171Z

yea but they seem kinda salty about it

- **tarunsingh@google.com** 2022-02-02T22:53:25.231Z

mark, dave, cheryl all mentioned google

- **tarunsingh@google.com** 2022-02-02T22:53:45.838Z

and were saying there's a conflict of interest b/c of G paying A for default search

- **dyc@google.com** 2022-02-02T22:53:46.604Z

Not to mention their ITP 2.0 changes

- **tarunsingh@google.com** 2022-02-02T22:53:46.977Z

etc

- **tarunsingh@google.com** 2022-02-02T22:55:50.693Z

here's cheryl saying apple is being regressive by hurting SMBs

- **tarunsingh@google.com** 2022-02-02T22:56:05.464Z

they seem overly annoyed at apple

- **dyc@google.com** 2022-02-02T22:56:14.369Z

I feel like they had the most to lose because (1) they don't have high intent search signals, and (2) they use data in more aggressive ways than Google

- **tarunsingh@google.com** 2022-02-02T22:56:25.734Z

even though apple delineated exactly what they would do

- **tarunsingh@google.com** 2022-02-02T22:56:53.290Z

they dont have control over an access point either

- **tarunsingh@google.com** 2022-02-02T22:56:55.191Z

ie no android

- **tarunsingh@google.com** 2022-02-02T22:57:18.809Z

probably makes their modeling for ATT harder

- **brownadam@google.com** 2022-02-02T22:58:21.830Z

Yeah, not having a customer touch point like Android and Chrome is the big issue for Meta. We also got customers comfortable with conversion modelling a while ago

- **meigs@google.com** 2022-02-02T23:00:46.831Z

Wow, down 22% at the moment. It looks like the "metaverse" is costing a lot to build:

<https://www.cnn.com/2022/02/02/meta-reality-labs-reports-10-billion-loss.html>

- <https://www.cnn.com/2022/02/02/meta-reality-labs-reports-10-billion-loss.html>

- **craigma@google.com** 2022-02-02T23:03:34.345Z

I ♥ our team all chatting like this!!

- **craigma@google.com** 2022-02-02T23:04:14.429Z

Also, suggest we turn off history since there is no business need for it ☺ unless anyone feel strongly against

Exhibit 4W

Custodian: Anthony Chavez; Marshall Vale

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-007857170

Message

From: aschavez@google.com [aschavez@google.com]
Sent: 6/10/2022 3:33:38 AM
To: aschavez@google.com; vinaygoel@google.com; wafflebits@google.com
Subject: AAAADORJqbQ-MBI-THREADED:TFsA6uSh-kk%%2022-06-09T08:33:38.162975
Attachments: Screen Shot 2022-06-09 at 11.41.41 PM.png

- **aschavez@google.com** 2022-06-10T03:33:38.162Z

separate topic - this chat room has history / is persisted?

- **aschavez@google.com** 2022-06-10T03:33:56.811Z

can we configure it to be transient?

- **vinaygoel@google.com** 2022-06-10T03:35:52.438Z

@Kevin Wacławicz @Chris Grzywacz - did one of you create this space? if so, do you have access to a settings panel?

- **wafflebits@google.com** 2022-06-10T03:35:59.433Z

If it cannot, I will delete this space and start a new one which is. Will check into it later tonight and make appropriate changes.

- **wafflebits@google.com** 2022-06-10T03:36:09.592Z

I created the space :)

- **aschavez@google.com** 2022-06-10T03:36:27.680Z

thx Kevin

- **vinaygoel@google.com** 2022-06-10T03:38:38.017Z

so, i dont think we can

- **vinaygoel@google.com** 2022-06-10T03:38:41.641Z

i think its set at the org level

- **Updated on** 2022-06-10T03:39:31.153Z

i think its set at the admin level

- **vinaygoel@google.com** 2022-06-10T03:39:19.589Z

if its not doable, are folks okay with a group chat? the benefit? no history. The con? No threads.

- **vinaygoel@google.com** 2022-06-10T03:40:13.091Z

Kevin and I just tried testing it out. We can't within a Space

- **aschavez@google.com** 2022-06-10T03:40:40.053Z

that's a bummer

- **vinaygoel@google.com** 2022-06-10T03:42:02.303Z

we're missing that 'history' setting on ours.

- Screen Shot 2022-06-09 at 11.41.41 PM.png

- **aschavez@google.com** 2022-06-10T03:42:43.016Z

my sense is we deal with a group chat? though I am in some spaces that have no history (though maybe not multi threading)

- **vinaygoel@google.com** 2022-06-10T03:43:26.896Z

if we remove threads here, then we can turn history off

- **aschavez@google.com** 2022-06-10T03:43:34.819Z

ah ok

- **vinaygoel@google.com** 2022-06-10T03:43:40.087Z

so, basically, threads is what prevents history from being turned off

- **vinaygoel@google.com** 2022-06-10T03:43:42.972Z

not chat vs space

- **aschavez@google.com** 2022-06-10T03:44:01.330Z

good to know :) i have been confused about the diff for a while...

- **vinaygoel@google.com** 2022-06-10T03:44:10.521Z

Yah, tbh, me too!

- **vinaygoel@google.com** 2022-06-10T03:44:18.223Z

okay, let me create a new one right now. It'll still be a space.

- **aschavez@google.com** 2022-06-10T03:44:24.242Z

cool - ty

Exhibit 4X

Custodian: Amin Charaniya

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-007610074

Message

From: hsnair@google.com [hsnair@google.com]
Sent: 9/23/2022 1:16:02 AM
To: acharaniya@google.com; hsnair@google.com
Subject: _h9UPwAAAAE-MBI-FLAT:2022-09-22T06:16:02.149951

• **hsnair@google.com** 2022-09-23T01:16:02.149Z

Hi

• **acharaniya@google.com** 2022-09-23T01:16:26.465Z

hey harikesh

• **hsnair@google.com** 2022-09-23T01:16:29.577Z

On the 2 pager on pcm for Google research

• **hsnair@google.com** 2022-09-23T01:17:08.501Z

I'm almost done on big picture priorities, and open gaps. Do you want to take a quick look before we open it open to research folks?

• **hsnair@google.com** 2022-09-23T01:17:10.044Z

[https://docs.google.com/document/d/1pDQPZRpk2-](https://docs.google.com/document/d/1pDQPZRpk2-9MWujv0C08b3bHDhjPqGJedUfwzS_IJhA/edit?usp=sharing&resourcekey=0-374xiMIfpfeP1BXuba1LCw)

[9MWujv0C08b3bHDhjPqGJedUfwzS_IJhA/edit?usp=sharing&resourcekey=0-374xiMIfpfeP1BXuba1LCw](https://docs.google.com/document/d/1pDQPZRpk2-9MWujv0C08b3bHDhjPqGJedUfwzS_IJhA/edit?usp=sharing&resourcekey=0-374xiMIfpfeP1BXuba1LCw)

○ https://drive.google.com/open?id=1pDQPZRpk2-9MWujv0C08b3bHDhjPqGJedUfwzS_IJhA

○ [https://docs.google.com/document/d/1pDQPZRpk2-](https://docs.google.com/document/d/1pDQPZRpk2-9MWujv0C08b3bHDhjPqGJedUfwzS_IJhA/edit?usp=sharing&resourcekey=0-374xiMIfpfeP1BXuba1LCw)

[9MWujv0C08b3bHDhjPqGJedUfwzS_IJhA/edit?usp=sharing&resourcekey=0-374xiMIfpfeP1BXuba1LCw](https://docs.google.com/document/d/1pDQPZRpk2-9MWujv0C08b3bHDhjPqGJedUfwzS_IJhA/edit?usp=sharing&resourcekey=0-374xiMIfpfeP1BXuba1LCw)

• **hsnair@google.com** 2022-09-23T01:17:25.497Z

Section 2 is still not done - Tong/Xiliang/Matt will finish up

• **acharaniya@google.com** 2022-09-23T01:21:55.876Z

i think you've captured all the main pieces. added a suggestion on panels

• **acharaniya@google.com** 2022-09-23T01:22:15.615Z

i'm assuming we aren't committing any resources from our side as part of this exercise, correct?

• **hsnair@google.com** 2022-09-23T01:22:33.139Z

great

• **hsnair@google.com** 2022-09-23T01:22:52.885Z

no...just putting out the main issues out there for them to have some visibility

• **acharaniya@google.com** 2022-09-23T01:23:07.313Z

sg. thx for doing this!

• **hsnair@google.com** 2022-09-23T01:23:10.209Z

we are slammed - have enough to do between now and 2023!!

• **acharaniya@google.com** 2022-09-23T01:23:26.198Z

😊

• **acharaniya@google.com** 2022-09-23T01:23:38.046Z

privacy = job security

- **hsnair@google.com** 2022-09-23T01:23:46.133Z

ha ha

- **acharaniya@google.com** 2022-09-23T01:23:58.401Z

btw didnt realize history is on for us

- **acharaniya@google.com** 2022-09-23T01:24:02.913Z

mind if i turn it off?

- **hsnair@google.com** 2022-09-23T01:24:10.549Z

sure

Chats Discussing Turning History Off

Exhibit 4Y

Custodian: Nitish Korula

Witness: Nitish Korula

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-B-004482121

Trial Exhibit No.: PTX0959

Message

From: Nitish Korula [nitish@google.com]
Sent: 4/16/2020 9:43:11 PM
To: Abhita Chugh [abhita@google.com]

• **Nitish Korula**, 2020-04-16 14:43:11

Have we really not had history on for these chats?

• **Nitish Korula**, 2020-04-16 14:43:30

I'm on lit hold, and am supposed to keep this on

• **Nitish Korula**, 2020-04-16 14:43:57

(I guess it's not bad because it was a personal conversation)

• **Abhita Chugh**, 2020-04-16 14:44:14

I might have turned it off. I have been accidentally turning history on and off in the new hangouts

• **Nitish Korula**, 2020-04-16 14:44:22

To be fair, this new UI makes it hard to tell when history is on or off

• **Nitish Korula**, 2020-04-16 14:44:26

Anyway, don't change the subject

• **Nitish Korula**, 2020-04-16 14:44:30

(Yes, yes, I know I did)

• **Nitish Korula**, 2020-04-16 14:44:34

You should take a Friday off

• **Abhita Chugh**, 2020-04-16 14:45:43

Yeah. I don't know what I would do with a day off right now. Haha

• **Abhita Chugh**, 2020-04-16 14:46:10

Keeping that as an option on days when nanny does not show up

• **Abhita Chugh**, 2020-04-16 14:46:25

Coz she always cancels on me after midnight

• **Nitish Korula**, 2020-04-16 14:54:10

Did she come in today?

• **Abhita Chugh**, 2020-04-16 14:54:35

Yes

• **Nitish Korula**, 2020-04-16 15:08:52

Small blessings 😊

Exhibit 4Z

Custodian: Woojin Kim

Witness: Woojin Kim

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-012301665

Trial Exhibit No.: PTX1108

Message

From: stassa@google.com [stassa@google.com]
Sent: 2/9/2023 8:02:48 PM
To: stassa@google.com; woojink@google.com; mmmartin@google.com; amjadh@google.com; coestlien@google.com; adamsmith@google.com
Subject: AAAA-tEzwF0-MBI-FLAT:2023-02-09T01:10:36.295759
Attachments: image.png; image.png

stassa@google.com February 9, 2023 at 8:02:48 PM UTC
Updated room membership.

woojink@google.com February 9, 2023 at 8:10:36 PM UTC
With history on

woojink@google.com February 9, 2023 at 8:17:04 PM UTC
I wish we had nice sandwiches in 901

woojink@google.com February 9, 2023 at 8:17:10 PM UTC
Like Crittenden

mmmartin@google.com February 9, 2023 at 8:20:13 PM UTC
I expected witty banter; I did not expect history on. That's tightrope.

amjadh@google.com February 9, 2023 at 8:20:17 PM UTC
Crit also has that reservation only indian place

woojink@google.com February 9, 2023 at 8:20:59 PM UTC
History on is a new thing

mmmartin@google.com February 9, 2023 at 8:23:10 PM UTC
Did you folks do something *very* wrong, and if so, can you document it in the chat for posterity?

coestlien@google.com February 9, 2023 at 8:32:09 PM UTC
history on?

woojink@google.com February 9, 2023 at 8:32:39 PM UTC
That's how we roll now

coestlien@google.com February 9, 2023 at 8:32:45 PM UTC
bruh

coestlien@google.com February 9, 2023 at 8:33:26 PM UTC
who is trying to get us in trouble?

woojink@google.com February 9, 2023 at 8:33:32 PM UTC
Good luck trying to turn it off

coestlien@google.com February 9, 2023 at 8:33:40 PM UTC
I tried

coestlien@google.com February 9, 2023 at 8:33:59 PM UTC
That's ok, we have our signal chat that Neal doesn't know about

woojink@google.com February 9, 2023 at 8:34:02 PM UTC
I think bard wants to train on our banter

coestlien@google.com February 9, 2023 at 8:35:06 PM UTC
the capital of Paris is Stasbourg

coestlien@google.com February 9, 2023 at 8:35:14 PM UTC
Strasbourg

woojink@google.com February 9, 2023 at 8:35:29 PM UTC
It already has that covered

amjadh@google.com February 9, 2023 at 8:52:18 PM UTC
Does anyone know who the presenter was in Paris that forgot the demo phone ?

stassa@google.com February 9, 2023 at 8:52:26 PM UTC
huh, can't seem to turn off history

woojink@google.com February 9, 2023 at 8:55:04 PM UTC
Liz

coestlien@google.com February 9, 2023 at 8:55:45 PM UTC

what did she do when she realized that?

woojink@google.com February 9, 2023 at 8:56:45 PM UTC
just moved on

coestlien@google.com February 9, 2023 at 8:57:01 PM UTC
reminds me of when I tried to demo voice commands via Nest Mini/Assistant at the YTV launch, and Assistant was down

woojink@google.com February 9, 2023 at 9:14:05 PM UTC
MidJourney's rendition of Neal Mohan:

woojink@google.com February 9, 2023 at 9:14:08 PM UTC
image.png

woojink@google.com February 9, 2023 at 9:15:38 PM UTC
david katz:

woojink@google.com February 9, 2023 at 9:15:42 PM UTC
image.png

adamsmith@google.com February 10, 2023 at 7:44:48 PM UTC
Figured out the Chat History. ON issue: One(s) of you must be on a litigation hold
<https://buganizer.corp.google.com/issues/268542670#comment4> m
<https://buganizer.corp.google.com/issues/268542670#comment4>

adamsmith@google.com February 10, 2023 at 7:45:13 PM UTC
Neal is now History ON all the time.

woojink@google.com February 10, 2023 at 8:47:11 PM UTC
I am on lit hold

woojink@google.com February 10, 2023 at 8:47:15 PM UTC
Sorry

coestlien@google.com February 10, 2023 at 8:51:21 PM UTC
I've been on litigation hold since 2006 :-)

coestlien@google.com February 10, 2023 at 8:51:31 PM UTC

Litigation

woojink@google.com February 10, 2023 at 8:54:35 PM UTC

New type of lit hold these dys

coestlien@google.com February 10, 2023 at 8:57:54 PM UTC

Y, chat is new

coestlien@google.com February 10, 2023 at 8:58:16 PM UTC

Guess we can only be funny in person from now on

adamsmith@google.com February 10, 2023 at 9:06:50 PM UTC

I guess we'll need to set up an unmonitored version of this chat for those of us that aren't under investigation to keep the funnies rolling ☐

amjadh@google.com February 10, 2023 at 9:10:20 PM UTC

We'll tell you lit hold folks know what is going on when we meet up in person

Updated on February 10, 2023 at 9:10:34 PM UTC

We'll let you lit hold folks know what is going on when we meet up in person

coestlien@google.com February 10, 2023 at 9:12:02 PM UTC

It's too late. Our feedback made it to the press.

coestlien@google.com February 10, 2023 at 9:12:07 PM UTC

<https://www.cnbc.com/2023/02/10/google-employees-slam-ceo-sundar-pichai-for-rushed-bard-announcement.html>

<https://www.cnbc.com/2023/02/10/google-employees-slam-ceo-sundar-pichai-for-rushed-bard-announcement.html>

Exhibit 4AA

Custodian: Aparna Pappu

Witness: Aparna Pappu

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-007385867

Trial Exhibit No.: PTX1819

Message

From: chaitali@google.com [chaitali@google.com]
Sent: 2/9/2023 3:30:59 PM
To: chaitali@google.com; apappu@google.com
Subject: mYbHBwAAAAE-MBI-FLAT:2023-02-08T20:30:59.990879

chaitali@google.com February 9, 2023 at 3:30:59 PM UTC

Sigh 1:1 chat also becomes history on when I message! How are you supposed to get any work done?!

apappu@google.com February 9, 2023 at 3:47:05 PM UTC

You can turn it off unless lithold kicks in

chaitali@google.com February 9, 2023 at 3:47:29 PM UTC

Tried. Cannot 😊

apappu@google.com February 9, 2023 at 3:47:35 PM UTC

weird

chaitali@google.com February 9, 2023 at 3:47:58 PM UTC

I say sell it as a premium feature in WS 😊

apappu@google.com February 9, 2023 at 3:50:49 PM UTC

Hah

apappu@google.com February 9, 2023 at 3:50:54 PM UTC

Can you file a bug though

apappu@google.com February 9, 2023 at 3:51:03 PM UTC

Unless you are on lit hold it should allow you to turn off

chaitali@google.com February 9, 2023 at 3:51:08 PM UTC

Will do

chaitali@google.com February 9, 2023 at 3:52:32 PM UTC

Isn't it WAI if one of the people in the conversation is on the lithold? Even if I'm not you are so this convo should be history on? I'm curious now. Will file a bug and follow up

apappu@google.com February 9, 2023 at 3:52:53 PM UTC

yes if anyone one person is then yes

apappu@google.com February 9, 2023 at 3:53:01 PM UTC

i thought you were saying all the ones with you and other people are also always on

chaitali@google.com February 9, 2023 at 3:53:18 PM UTC

Oh no no

chaitali@google.com February 9, 2023 at 3:53:57 PM UTC

I wanted to see if 1:1 chats also get subject to this. Looks like they do. We build robust products!

apappu@google.com February 9, 2023 at 4:09:39 PM UTC

yes all chats not just group

apappu@google.com February 9, 2023 at 4:09:46 PM UTC

otherwise it doesnt make sense

Exhibit 4BB

Custodian: Deepti Bhatnagar

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-008017534

Trial Exhibit No.: PTX1105

Message

From: apappu@google.com [apappu@google.com]
Sent: 2/9/2023 3:26:17 PM
To: apappu@google.com; ahogue@google.com; mariafg@google.com; abhita@google.com; pbrittan@google.com; sergel@google.com; jdanzt@google.com; ameeshp@google.com; jmckinley@google.com; antin@google.com; ilyabr@google.com; madrake@google.com; tommi@google.com; ekevers@google.com; bryanv@google.com; mduffy@google.com; anniechen@google.com; vikki@google.com; richf@google.com; awiesen@google.com; baxterjeff@google.com; anuragag@google.com; mariannaw@google.com; rachelroca@google.com; rshapov@google.com; jaisunda@google.com; dianenarouz@google.com; do-not-reply-bot@system.gserviceaccount.com
Subject: AAAAWyF-lml-MBI-FLAT:2023-02-08T20:26:17.291023
Attachments: Screenshot 2023-02-09 1.47.12 PM.png; _inverseduck_.dat

apappu@google.com February 9, 2023 at 3:26:17 PM UTC

And I apologize folks but due to changes in legal requirements and a lithold I am on (perhaps many others) all chats with me become history on! Changes rolled out yesterday in Google.

3 Replies

ahogue@google.com February 9, 2023 at 3:28:55 PM UTC

you know how happy this is making me, Aparna ❤️

apappu@google.com February 9, 2023 at 3:29:57 PM UTC

Oh I know

mariafg@google.com February 9, 2023 at 3:52:32 PM UTC

Yessssssss

apappu@google.com February 9, 2023 at 4:06:11 PM UTC

(Long Post Warning) OK so in advance of our group chat on yesterday's announcement here's what I think: 1. Competition is great, its great for us, it's great for users, it's great for everyone. 2. One gaffe does not take away from over 2 decades of some of the most profound breakthroughs in ranking, relevance, ML, AI and software and product design. I think we have an inverse duck problem - we see the furious paddling of the duck but there are deep waters where a lot of continued great work, care over quality etc etc continues. The press creates this frenzy and we should avoid feeding into it. And focus on what we can do - build amazing products that users love. Think for a second if this was us - how would we want our colleagues to respond? The same with the stock market - it's daily fluctuations are not reflective of true value. 3. Details however do matter -for e.g. when we send important MSAs I review them because how we present our selves to the world sometimes has far greater consequences than we can imagine and allows me to be responsible for any fall out. 4. Speaking of how we communicate - you are all officers of the company - what you say matters (in public I mean), you represent Google and carry its reputation forward. So in that light for LLMs, AI in general it's important we educate ourselves, we avoid speculation in public, in our teams we can be more candid - that's what's great about our culture. But candid and being doomsday are two different things. 5. Finally LLMs have the power to bring great fun, utility and service to all our products. I am super proud of the work we're doing and the care going into it. We are trying to land two very real features one in Docs and one in Gmail in March but that's just the beginning, there is so much more we can do and our OKRs reflect that. If you want to help ask your area lead how you can contribute . In short I remain incredibly optimistic and am confident we have the right team to deliver on our ambitious promises.

4 Replies

abhita@google.com February 9, 2023 at 4:10:01 PM UTC

Completely agree - I do think Google is best positioned to do well in this area. And we have enough smart people putting their brains to it - there's no reason we shouldn't be able to. Press tends to overreact & it just reiterates for us that the quality bar is higher for Google.

pbrittan@google.com February 9, 2023 at 4:11:06 PM UTC

Yes, and we do prob need to get a little smarter about how we position ourselves in the AI/ML context.

mariafg@google.com February 9, 2023 at 4:23:10 PM UTC

In a way, and I know it is weird for the market share we have in search, but this has positioned us as the underdog in this race. We have all the tech, all the people, and all of the distribution to get back to the top. Let's do this!

apappu@google.com February 9, 2023 at 10:55:37 PM UTC

And the inverse in Workspace we are the underdog relative to MS so let's go out swinging - we have nothing to lose so we can afford to take risks in the Enterprise.

sergel@google.com February 9, 2023 at 4:11:16 PM UTC

Hopefully others will recognize themselves in this (I am too sensitive, I know) ... but the events of the past 2-3 weeks sure makes everything feel so much more intense.

apappu@google.com February 9, 2023 at 4:21:05 PM UTC

Happy to discuss more at our next monthly Director Sync

jdanz@google.com February 9, 2023 at 4:25:25 PM UTC

Aparna, tell the truth, was that long post generated by Bard?

1 Reply

ahogue@google.com February 9, 2023 at 5:16:58 PM UTC

No, it was authentic. The tell was "inverse duck problem"

apappu@google.com February 9, 2023 at 8:58:53 PM UTC

In another PSA - comp season is on. Anurag, Johanna, Steve and I will share a proposal with you all. I do not want you all doing your "own thing" for comp please stay tuned.

apappu@google.com February 9, 2023 at 9:08:27 PM UTC

Esp y'all in Eng - I know you all too well.

ameeshp@google.com February 9, 2023 at 9:15:42 PM UTC

Exhibit 4CC

Custodian: David Mitby; Tobias Maurer; Woojin Kim

Witness: Woojin Kim

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-012301658

Trial Exhibit No.: PTX1107

Message

From: woojink@google.com [woojink@google.com]
Sent: 2/9/2023 6:40:42 PM
To: woojink@google.com; dym@google.com; tmaurer@google.com; dmitby@google.com; triswarkentin@google.com
Subject: AAAA2-mDPOM-MBI-FLAT:2023-02-08T23:40:42.326639
Attachments: image.png; image.png

woojink@google.com February 9, 2023 at 6:40:42 PM UTC
do all your gchats now have history=ON?

dym@google.com February 9, 2023 at 6:41:25 PM UTC
no

woojink@google.com February 9, 2023 at 6:41:35 PM UTC
but this chat room is now

dym@google.com February 9, 2023 at 6:41:38 PM UTC
but I'm surprised about the switch in this room

tmaurer@google.com February 9, 2023 at 6:42:03 PM UTC
yeah mine is also always on

tmaurer@google.com February 9, 2023 at 6:42:05 PM UTC
odd ;)

woojink@google.com February 9, 2023 at 6:42:17 PM UTC
odd ;)

woojink@google.com February 9, 2023 at 6:42:36 PM UTC
i feel like i can't even joke around any more

woojink@google.com February 9, 2023 at 6:42:41 PM UTC
on non work topics

tmaurer@google.com February 9, 2023 at 6:43:43 PM UTC
when are we meeting again? did you guys plan for something?

dmitby@google.com February 9, 2023 at 6:45:47 PM UTC

sorry i think that's due to me; maybe kick me out and see if that fixes it? there was a change to legal hold rules i guess (at least for something i'm on). for non work feel free to ping me dmitby@gmail.com (also on Signal and such)

woojink@google.com February 9, 2023 at 6:46:42 PM UTC

Me too though

woojink@google.com February 9, 2023 at 6:46:49 PM UTC

I bet tobias

triswarkentin@google.com February 9, 2023 at 6:49:12 PM UTC

we had it on before but someone turned it off

triswarkentin@google.com February 9, 2023 at 6:49:30 PM UTC

also, stock continues to plunge

tmaurer@google.com February 9, 2023 at 6:49:46 PM UTC

Can't talk about it

triswarkentin@google.com February 9, 2023 at 6:49:49 PM UTC

Ben Thompson of Stratechery captured my feelings almost entirely about the pragh event yesterday

triswarkentin@google.com February 9, 2023 at 6:49:51 PM UTC

image.png

woojink@google.com February 9, 2023 at 6:52:18 PM UTC

Yeah

woojink@google.com February 9, 2023 at 6:52:36 PM UTC

Not a confidence inspiring preso

woojink@google.com February 9, 2023 at 6:52:40 PM UTC

Why was it in Paris?

woojink@google.com February 9, 2023 at 6:52:45 PM UTC

Where was Sundar?

triswarkentin@google.com February 9, 2023 at 6:59:40 PM UTC

it was a preplanned event for Google Arts and Culture anniversary

triswarkentin@google.com February 9, 2023 at 6:59:55 PM UTC

Pragh decided it should be pivoted to be about AI about a ~month ago

triswarkentin@google.com February 9, 2023 at 7:00:00 PM UTC

but then they were going to NOT do that

triswarkentin@google.com February 9, 2023 at 7:00:06 PM UTC

so I'm not sure how it got switched back

triswarkentin@google.com February 9, 2023 at 7:00:34 PM UTC

Pragh wants to be the AI Lead for Google -- hence fighting to get search response fully separated from RMI even though their models don't perform

triswarkentin@google.com February 9, 2023 at 7:00:40 PM UTC

and Sissie owning Bard

triswarkentin@google.com February 9, 2023 at 7:01:01 PM UTC

say what you will about Clay

triswarkentin@google.com February 9, 2023 at 7:01:11 PM UTC

but if Clay had organized a presentation about the future of AI for a Paris event

triswarkentin@google.com February 9, 2023 at 7:01:15 PM UTC

I bet our stock woulda gone up =)

dym@google.com February 9, 2023 at 7:04:00 PM UTC

Well if Pragh wants to be AI lead for Google, he's not exactly going about it the right way

woojink@google.com February 9, 2023 at 7:05:28 PM UTC

Clay would've done a great job at the announcement

dym@google.com February 9, 2023 at 7:14:17 PM UTC

interesting that I can't turn off history here

dym@google.com February 9, 2023 at 7:14:45 PM UTC
image.png

tmaurer@google.com February 10, 2023 at 6:02:01 AM UTC
Very strange.

woojink@google.com February 10, 2023 at 6:44:31 AM UTC
It's new lit hold

woojink@google.com February 10, 2023 at 6:44:33 AM UTC
Sorry

dmitby@google.com February 10, 2023 at 4:59:25 PM UTC
(i'm in the same boat FWIW, as are many others)

tmaurer@google.com February 10, 2023 at 8:08:30 PM UTC
same

dmitby@google.com February 10, 2023 at 8:37:01 PM UTC
what are your phone #'s

tmaurer@google.com February 10, 2023 at 8:38:16 PM UTC
3477121297

dym@google.com February 10, 2023 at 8:40:54 PM UTC
9173311533

woojink@google.com February 10, 2023 at 8:47:33 PM UTC
6508681456

woojink@google.com February 10, 2023 at 8:47:39 PM UTC
Are we planning a get together!?

woojink@google.com February 10, 2023 at 8:47:48 PM UTC
Just stopped by my ne house

woojink@google.com February 10, 2023 at 8:47:53 PM UTC

It'll be ready soon to welcome yall

tmaurer@google.com February 10, 2023 at 8:49:37 PM UTC

Our expectations are exoplanetary high at this point.

woojink@google.com February 10, 2023 at 8:55:28 PM UTC

Ah yes

woojink@google.com February 10, 2023 at 8:55:35 PM UTC

I'll make sure to get the jwst ready

tmaurer@google.com February 10, 2023 at 8:56:15 PM UTC

;))

triswarkentin@google.com February 10, 2023 at 9:29:48 PM UTC

9782575386

triswarkentin@google.com February 10, 2023 at 9:31:37 PM UTC

yeah dude, we gotta get together asap

triswarkentin@google.com February 10, 2023 at 9:31:42 PM UTC

I'm at the end of my rope over here =)

triswarkentin@google.com February 10, 2023 at 9:34:03 PM UTC

just made us a whatsapp group

triswarkentin@google.com February 10, 2023 at 9:34:04 PM UTC

<https://chat.whatsapp.com/GTwtwr5LwOK9wHgf9WmuB3>

<https://chat.whatsapp.com/GTwtwr5LwOK9wHgf9WmuB3>

tmaurer@google.com February 10, 2023 at 10:40:30 PM UTC

Do you guys know Threema?

tmaurer@google.com February 10, 2023 at 10:41:06 PM UTC

Per is stopping by for a drink around 5 at my house ;)

triswarkentin@google.com February 10, 2023 at 11:38:30 PM UTC

never heard of threema

triswarkentin@google.com February 10, 2023 at 11:38:33 PM UTC
chat app?

triswarkentin@google.com February 10, 2023 at 11:38:42 PM UTC
we need multiplayer bard amirite

tmaurer@google.com February 10, 2023 at 11:50:15 PM UTC
My most paranoid friends in Germany use it for texting.

tmaurer@google.com February 10, 2023 at 11:50:58 PM UTC
Have a great weekend y'all. I'm one grad convo with my VP away from it.

dmitby@google.com February 10, 2023 at 11:53:23 PM UTC
you didn't already do your grad convo?

triswarkentin@google.com February 11, 2023 at 12:01:01 AM UTC
mitby you're the only one missing from our whatsapp now

triswarkentin@google.com February 11, 2023 at 12:01:02 AM UTC
<https://chat.whatsapp.com/GTwtwr5LwOK9wHgf9WmuB3>
<https://chat.whatsapp.com/GTwtwr5LwOK9wHgf9WmuB3>

Exhibit 4DD

Custodian: Aparna Pappu; Sagnik Nandy

Witness: Aparna Pappu

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-018279549

Trial Exhibit No.: PTX0851

Message

From: apappu@google.com [apappu@google.com]
Sent: 9/16/2019 2:41:42 PM
To: apappu@google.com; bahman@google.com; sagnik@google.com
Subject: AAAACIPEHao-4P--NjxXoek

- **apappu@google.com** 2019-09-16T14:41:42.247Z

So ABCs it turns out vegas is not vegas. Chat in it's infinite wisdom does _not_ have a history off option for rooms. That's right. Everything kept forever or until garbage collected which I think for rooms with no activity is 28 days? Nope I lied, it's forever

- **apappu@google.com** 2019-09-16T14:42:28.605Z

We need to go thru a convoluted set of steps to make a history off group chat in old classic hangouts and then use that here - that's the only way

- **apappu@google.com** 2019-09-16T14:42:33.250Z

Chris want to do the honours?

- **bahman@google.com** 2019-09-30T16:49:15.189Z

Promo related reviews done. Whoo. Whoo?

- **bahman@google.com** 2019-09-30T16:50:40.741Z

3/14 peers are YT-side. 1/12 promo related peers are YT-side.

- **bahman@google.com** 2019-09-30T16:50:49.564Z

It will be weird if that holds up another cycle.

- **sagnik@google.com** 2019-09-30T17:08:59.562Z

33/35 done. One strange one got added last night. Otherwise would be just one left

- **bahman@google.com** 2019-09-30T17:25:10.182Z

I got 7 lengthy emails last week from an individual I have not worked with in 6 months. "New information to add to your peer review".

- **bahman@google.com** 2019-09-30T17:25:12.006Z

No.

- **sagnik@google.com** 2019-09-30T20:41:12.968Z

1 left - but bought some breathing room for it till tomorrow

Exhibit 4EE

Custodian: Marshall Vale

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-011213261

Trial Exhibit No.: PTX0908

Message

From: Nitish Korula [nitish@google.com]
Sent: 1/14/2020 4:10:30 PM
To: Justin Schuh [jschuh@google.com]; Michael Kleber [kleber@google.com]; Marshall Vale [mjv@google.com]; Brad Lassey [lassey@google.com]; Chetna Bindra [cbindra@google.com]; Deepak Ravichandran [deepakr@google.com]

• **Nitish Korula**, 2020-01-14 08:10:30

FYI, I thought you'd all be interested that the AdExchanger website doesn't seem to be able to keep up after the article went live

• **Nitish Korula**, 2020-01-14 08:10:51

https://chat.google.com/api/get hangouts_attachment_url?url_type=FIFE_URL&attachment_token=AOe91x3GI-kjNiRQyR6QBBbrtukurUcPy3vWR9-77FY2vOMqcZNPk4_K_lrSfVBWONqzjw8NvLBh9CN2TuIZ-rC_jIEIQaQ_2rqkZ2-GWtK76XMGc7PtJYIK85F5KtquA0OD9IrK5rAWwN7HoIQQETcA26CRO1BOPZ_ODeOSgo3l3Gf81MEUTCykXdET9-P5t06t_OeeRc-Go1dy33Xs-335C9WR_apFH0w0IT3bA4Y2MfRkZ3d33VXHNj300xRTTwTE

• **Nitish Korula**, 2020-01-14 08:11:06

It's now up again, but slow / sporadic

• **Deepak Ravichandran**, 2020-01-14 08:27:49

Haha

• **Michael Kleber**, 2020-01-14 08:28:50

Whaaa? "The idea bears some similarity to Ads Data Hub (ADH), a Google spokesperson said. Since Google closed off access to DoubleClick IDs, the only way to analyze user-level information in campaigns is through Google's privacy-focused ADH cloud. And the data can't be exported."

• **Michael Kleber**, 2020-01-14 08:29:10

Ugh, I don't think this bears much resemblance to ADH at all

• **Chetna Bindra**, 2020-01-14 08:29:28

She is literally the stupidest reporter on the block

• **Chetna Bindra**, 2020-01-14 08:29:33

Always has been

• **Michael Kleber**, 2020-01-14 08:29:53

☹️

• **Michael Kleber**, 2020-01-14 08:30:53

Ah well, everything else seems pretty good

• **Nitish Korula**, 2020-01-14 08:31:05

<Refraining from comments because I'm lit hold, but happy to rant in person> ☺️

• **Michael Kleber**, 2020-01-14 08:31:07

I like the Digiday piece

• **Michael Kleber**, 2020-01-14 08:31:07

<a href="https://www.google.com/url?q=https://digiday.com/media/google-plans-kill-off-third-party-cookies-chrome-within-2-years/&sa=D&source=hangouts&ust=1579105868347000&usg=AFQjCNH5Ilc1qwn61GX

QyY5ej1-JOnqKsQ">https://digiday.com/media/google-plans-kill-off-third-party-cookies-chrome-within-2-years/

- **Chetna Bindra**, 2020-01-14 08:31:28

Let's do a ping thread with history off and without Nitish...

- **Nitish Korula**, 2020-01-14 08:31:36

Yeah, you all totally should

- **Nitish Korula**, 2020-01-14 08:31:45

(Though I think Brad and Michael are as well ;)

- **Michael Kleber**, 2020-01-14 08:32:33

Hah. I'm on lithold too, folks

- **Brad Lassey**, 2020-01-14 08:33:41

I am not on lit hold

- **Brad Lassey**, 2020-01-14 08:33:45

kind of amazingly

- **Michael Kleber**, 2020-01-14 08:35:44

Ugh yeah AdExchanger gets even worse. "For instance, an ad tech provider might call Chrome for a list of people who have visited a group of 100 sites, avoiding granular targeting. Or, Chrome might group people with similar browsing habits." Ugh no, not at all

- **Brad Lassey**, 2020-01-14 08:58:22

they sent those for fact checking and we corrected them (I thought). Disappointing that they didn't take those corrections

- **Chetna Bindra**, 2020-01-14 09:01:44

We did correct

- **Chetna Bindra**, 2020-01-14 09:01:57

She still wrote nonsense

- **Chetna Bindra**, 2020-01-14 09:02:07

We sent it last night well before her deadline

- **Michael Kleber**, 2020-01-14 09:05:50

ah well, so it goes

- **Deepak Ravichandran**, 2020-01-14 09:19:07

"For instance, an ad tech provider might call Chrome for a list of people who have visited a group of 100 sites, avoiding granular targeting. Or, Chrome might group people with similar browsing habits." - this is ok - right?

- **Deepak Ravichandran**, 2020-01-14 09:19:15

the right spirit

- **Deepak Ravichandran**, 2020-01-14 09:19:22

since these are not decided.

- **Michael Kleber**, 2020-01-14 09:21:36

The "group people with similar browsing habits" part is right. But "call Chrome for a list of people who have visited a group of 100 sites"? No, there are no lists of people

- **Deepak Ravichandran**, 2020-01-14 09:24:34



- **Deepak Ravichandran**, 2020-01-14 09:24:56

not people - but groups of people.

- **Deepak Ravichandran**, 2020-01-14 09:25:14

or a cohort

- **Deepak Ravichandran**, 2020-01-14 09:25:16

anyway

- **Deepak Ravichandran**, 2020-01-14 09:25:22

now is the real deal

- **Chetna Bindra**, 2020-01-14 09:25:27

Folks - this thread has history on

- **Deepak Ravichandran**, 2020-01-14 09:25:30

we better get our act together

- **Chetna Bindra**, 2020-01-14 09:25:33

Please be cautious

- **Chetna Bindra**, 2020-01-14 09:25:36

Agreed

- **Deepak Ravichandran**, 2020-01-14 09:25:49

ok

- **Chetna Bindra**, 2020-01-14 09:25:54

Monthly milestones are going to be critical

Chats Recognizing That Turning History Off Is To Evade Discovery

Exhibit 4FF

Custodian: Dan Taylor

Witness: Dan Taylor

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-009480562

Trial Exhibit No.: PTX1801

Message

From: suzblackburn@google.com [suzblackburn@google.com]
Sent: 2/24/2023 9:01:22 PM
To: suzblackburn@google.com; dantaylor@google.com; vlucile@google.com
Subject: AAAALXeKZc0-MBI-FLAT:2023-02-24T02:01:30.715637
Attachments: image.png

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:01:22 PM UTC
Updated room membership.

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:01:30 PM UTC
hi both

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:02:11 PM UTC
we have some incoming from the NYT - they are writing a story about how chatbots are going to disrupt the internet economy with a focus on Google

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:02:41 PM UTC
they asked for Philipp on the record and we're thinking about offering you Dan. 😊 Interview would need to be early next week

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:02:59 PM UTC
is this doable? Could you do in person? I think you're going to be out in MTV right?

dantaylor@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:03:49 PM UTC
ha. Allie told me to less is more when talking about Chatbots

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:03:59 PM UTC
LOL

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:04:03 PM UTC
well she is right

dantaylor@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:04:05 PM UTC
i will be in SF Wednesday and Thursday

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:04:08 PM UTC
but we think this one is going to be bad

dantaylor@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:04:12 PM UTC

i see

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:04:17 PM UTC

and it could help if we engage

dantaylor@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:04:24 PM UTC

i'll do it if we can mke the timework

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:04:33 PM UTC

let me see if that would work, we're hearing that they want to run this on Wed

dantaylor@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:04:52 PM UTC

hm ok then would be remote mon/tue then, i'll be wfh and am flexible

dantaylor@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:04:54 PM UTC

those 2 dyas

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:05:00 PM UTC

k thank you

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:05:20 PM UTC

just testing the waters, will come back. Lin is running this idea by Corey right now

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:05:23 PM UTC

(our big boss)

dantaylor@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:05:55 PM UTC

early days, AI is foundational, PMax, we've done platform shifts before etc. the one place i riffed was that conversational AI could be one mode of an answer

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:06:05 PM UTC

it would essentially be the talk track you're already using btw

dantaylor@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:06:09 PM UTC

like image could be for another, or a video for another, a blue link for another

dantaylor@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:06:11 PM UTC

ok

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:06:12 PM UTC

related to chatbots

dantaylor@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:06:24 PM UTC

i got cornered by WSJ asking about publisher impact

dantaylor@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:06:31 PM UTC

need to sharpen or deflect that better

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:06:34 PM UTC

yea I heard

vlucile@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:06:40 PM UTC

is this coming from Nico, Suz?

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:06:42 PM UTC

we'll need to prep you for this for sure

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:06:45 PM UTC

yes 😊

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:06:50 PM UTC

Nico is not our frience

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:06:53 PM UTC

*friend

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:06:57 PM UTC

will be a tough interview

vlucile@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:07:33 PM UTC

if we can push to have the interview on Wed pm PT, that would be ideal - in person and after the training with Lynn

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:07:53 PM UTC

got it, yes that would be ideal

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:07:56 PM UTC
and then we could in person

dantaylor@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:08:18 PM UTC
sgtn

dantaylor@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:08:19 PM UTC
m

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:08:20 PM UTC
There are three specific areas where they see Google contributing to this article: How Google is thinking about LLM and the way it will impact Search and Ads? For e.g., advertising may become less lucrative if users start depending on chatbots. There is a general excitement about chatbots – what are Google’s plans of leveraging it? Traditionally, Google has sent traffic to publishers, if that changes, what happens to these long-standing relationships that Google has had with publishers?

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:09:11 PM UTC
we may also decide to offer Philipp off the record as a carrot

dantaylor@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:09:48 PM UTC
that makes me
image.png

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:09:52 PM UTC
LOL

dantaylor@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:10:45 PM UTC
also, i need to remember that all my chats are now saved/discoverable by default, just FYI

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:10:53 PM UTC
yes mine too

dantaylor@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:10:55 PM UTC
k

dantaylor@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:11:13 PM UTC

biblical jokes dont age well

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 9:12:26 PM UTC

really? they seem pretty timeless to me!

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 10:03:29 PM UTC

Corey is on board with the plan so we're going to move it forward

suzblackburn@google.com February 24, 2023 at 10:03:35 PM UTC

going to send out a note to execs and will copy you Dan

suzblackburn@google.com February 25, 2023 at 12:22:06 AM UTC

@Dan Taylor we just talked to reporter and ideally we can set up interview on Monday afternoon ET which means prepping Monday morning. Ok to ask Vera to prioritize?

dantaylor@google.com February 25, 2023 at 12:44:45 AM UTC

Sure. Nothing on Monday that can't be rescheduled so boom what works

dantaylor@google.com February 25, 2023 at 12:44:50 AM UTC

*book

suzblackburn@google.com February 25, 2023 at 12:48:44 AM UTC

Thanks Dan

dantaylor@google.com February 25, 2023 at 12:49:08 AM UTC

I live to serve..

suzblackburn@google.com February 25, 2023 at 12:49:53 AM UTC

We appreciate it

Exhibit 4GG

Custodian: Danielle Romain

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-010366478

Trial Exhibit No.: PTX1797

Message

From: yvettehc@google.com [yvettehc@google.com]
Sent: 11/10/2021 6:15:58 PM
To: yvettehc@google.com; domain@google.com
Subject: AAAAAiEErHE-MBI-FLAT:2021-11-09T23:15:58.284495

- **yvettehc@google.com** 2021-11-10T18:15:58.284Z

ok for me to keep history on here? need to keep some info for memory purposes 😊

- **domain@google.com** 2021-11-10T18:34:34.134Z

Yvette, unfortunately, I'm not supportive of turning history on. The discussion that started this thread gets into legal and potentially competitive territory, which I'd like to be conscientious of having under privilege. So that you're aware, when history is on, it's discoverable. Sometimes that's totally fine but I'd like to stick to the default of history off. Thanks

Exhibit 4HH

Custodian: Vidhya Srinivasan

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-014680318

Trial Exhibit No.: PTX1000

Message

From: Vidhya Srinivasan [vids@google.com]
Sent: 10/29/2020 4:44:03 PM
To: Christophe Combette [ccombette@google.com]

• **Vidhya Srinivasan, 2020-10-29 09:44:03**

hi

• **Vidhya Srinivasan, 2020-10-29 09:44:09**

is there a new deck for mtg tomorrow?

• **Christophe Combette, 2020-10-29 09:44:16**

working on it now

• **Christophe Combette, 2020-10-29 09:44:24**

will share before noon

• **Vidhya Srinivasan, 2020-10-29 09:44:25**

thanks

• **Christophe Combette, 2020-10-29 09:45:42**

have you seen the deck for later today?

• **Christophe Combette, 2020-10-29 09:45:44**

https://docs.google.com/presentation/d/1RB4uFprGQtEjmBkk5MLrjU4rZVVrTL01LkLL_TZ86FY/edit#slide=id.ga506638254_0_5

• **Vidhya Srinivasan, 2020-10-29 09:47:02**

what should I pay attention to?

• **Christophe Combette, 2020-10-29 09:47:40**

mostly the timeline

• **Christophe Combette, 2020-10-29 09:48:03**

and the content of the messaging strategy on p4

• **Christophe Combette, 2020-10-29 09:48:39**

essentially plan is to go out with something that talks about Anning but doesn't say whether we will comply or not (just that we won't use IDFA).

• **Christophe Combette, 2020-10-29 09:49:00**

Backchannel with the press to try focus the PR on competition

• **Christophe Combette, 2020-10-29 09:49:08**

(for Apple)

• **Christophe Combette, 2020-10-29 09:49:18**

If it lands, we go with Plan A

• **Christophe Combette, 2020-10-29 09:49:28**

if we land in privacy narratives, we fall back on plan B

- **Vidhya Srinivasan**, 2020-10-29 09:49:40

this is good..we should add to deck tomorrow

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 09:49:46

yes

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 09:49:51

I am using this

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 09:50:02

and then going to add more detail on "dreadlines" after phase A

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 09:50:10

phase A = initial blog

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 09:50:17

the one thing I uncovered yesterday

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 09:50:27

and might come up tomorrow if you are talking to Hiroshi

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 09:50:40

it seems as though Android isn't sold on announcing Anning

- **Vidhya Srinivasan**, 2020-10-29 09:51:04

can we go thru this together at 5:30pm

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 09:51:09

we need to bring them into the conversation more

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 09:51:14

yes

- **Vidhya Srinivasan**, 2020-10-29 09:51:22

or 5

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 09:51:58

just sent you an invite for 5:30

- **Vidhya Srinivasan**, 2020-10-29 09:52:10

ok

- **Vidhya Srinivasan**, 2020-10-29 09:59:58

Does the new French suit against Apple change our strategy

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 10:01:29

I would assume it helps

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 10:01:44

the two are very unrelated in that this is about wholesale of hardware

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 10:01:48

and the app store

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 10:02:10

but on the surface, the story is "Apple's behavior is not healthy for competition"

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 10:02:41

it's the kind of tidbit they would add to the articles, like Epic

- **Vidhya Srinivasan**, 2020-10-29 10:06:21

what was the exact suit

- **Vidhya Srinivasan**, 2020-10-29 10:06:28

exact

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 10:06:42

https://www.cnn.com/2020/03/16/tech/apple-fine-france/index.html

- **Christophe Combette**, 2020-10-29 10:08:09

do you know if our pings are privileged / discoverable?

- **Vidhya Srinivasan**, 2020-10-29 10:08:39

we should turn history off

Chats Reflecting Lawyer Directives To Turn History Off

Exhibit 4II

Custodian: Nitish Korula

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-B-003992377

Trial Exhibit No.: PTX0891

Message

From: Nitish Korula [nitish@google.com]
Sent: 11/12/2019 8:59:25 PM
To: Jonathan Pearson [finchley@google.com]; Uchechi Okereke [uchechi@google.com]; Curt Harting [rcharting@google.com]

- **Nitish Korula**, 2019-11-12 12:59:25

Curt, Jonathan: Can we preserve old DT files from the last 60 days

- **Curt Harting**, 2019-11-12 12:59:35

Talked to Chech now

- **Nitish Korula**, 2019-11-12 12:59:39

Ok, great

- **Curt Harting**, 2019-11-12 12:59:47

Will email Jonathan to get him up to speed

- **Uchechi Okereke**, 2019-11-12 12:59:49

Please can we turn history off?

Exhibit 4JJ

Custodian: Dan Taylor

Witness: Dan Taylor

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-009452636

Trial Exhibit No.: PTX0649

Message

From: Bhanu Narasimhan [bhanun@google.com]
Sent: 9/4/2018 7:24:36 PM
To: Courtney Kuhl [ckuhl@google.com]; Shankar Ponnekanti [shankar@google.com]; Ted Lazarus [tlazarus@google.com]; Shree Madhavapeddi [shreem@google.com]; Payam Shodjai [pshodjai@google.com]; Dan Taylor [dantaylor@google.com]; Pankaj Deshpande [reply-106034586383358357354@profiles.google.com]; Vivek Rao [vivekrao@google.com]; Andy Miller [andymiller@google.com]; Vic Liu [reply-116024347688485432888@profiles.google.com]; Matt Kellogg [mkellogg@google.com]; Emily Garber [egarber@google.com]; Lauren Gomez [lgomez@google.com]; Vicky Homan [vickyhoman@google.com]
Subject: Advertiser Uploaded Data - ACM

- **Bhanu Narasimhan**, 2018-09-04 12:24:36

ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGED

- **Bhanu Narasimhan**, 2018-09-04 12:24:40

Folks

- **Bhanu Narasimhan**, 2018-09-04 12:25:32

we had a discussion at Ads Review about advertiser uploaded data, and will need to schedule an ACM - content will be roughly from this ads review doc: https://docs.google.com/document/d/1kXedMn_T2J1bkxIFpuOyA4Seri_Eck7SpJPe9Hf2xyU/edit?pli=1

- **Ted Lazarus**, 2018-09-04 12:25:38

bhanu can we keep pings off the record pls

- **Bhanu Narasimhan**, 2018-09-04 12:26:05

(ok will turn history off)

Exhibit 4KK

Custodian: Nirmal Jayaram; Vivek Rao

Witness: Nirmal Jayaram

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-008520405

Trial Exhibit No.: PTX1070

Message

From: arta@google.com [arta@google.com]
Sent: 8/16/2022 6:30:37 PM
To: arta@google.com; dbturner@google.com; xiaoyong@google.com; brchan@google.com; kalambur@google.com
Subject: AAAATQGfLhI-MBI-THREADED:ri_eckjQhZM%%2022-08-15T23:30:37.736799

- **arta@google.com** 2022-08-16T18:30:37.736Z

Whoa

- **Deleted on**2022-10-20T00:12:40.295Z

Whoa

- **arta@google.com** 2022-08-16T18:30:44.703Z

Ryan just dropped the most important doc for DMA

- **Deleted on**2022-10-20T00:12:40.295Z

Ryan just dropped the most important doc for DMA

- **arta@google.com** 2022-08-16T18:30:51.774Z

https://docs.google.com/document/d/1mJwkQsSWm3y_1qYJP1jeEAkKBD0sFjdWau59diOMmRk/edit?resourcekey=0-hjyRIuWni39slJ8qY7O7mg

○ https://docs.google.com/document/d/1mJwkQsSWm3y_1qYJP1jeEAkKBD0sFjdWau59diOMmRk/edit?resourcekey=0-hjyRIuWni39slJ8qY7O7mg

○ https://drive.google.com/open?id=1mJwkQsSWm3y_1qYJP1jeEAkKBD0sFjdWau59diOMmRk

- **Deleted on**2022-10-20T00:12:40.295Z

https://docs.google.com/document/d/1mJwkQsSWm3y_1qYJP1jeEAkKBD0sFjdWau59diOMmRk/edit?resourcekey=0-hjyRIuWni39slJ8qY7O7mg

○ https://docs.google.com/document/d/1mJwkQsSWm3y_1qYJP1jeEAkKBD0sFjdWau59diOMmRk/edit?resourcekey=0-hjyRIuWni39slJ8qY7O7mg

○ https://drive.google.com/open?id=1mJwkQsSWm3y_1qYJP1jeEAkKBD0sFjdWau59diOMmRk

- **dbturner@google.com** 2022-08-16T18:31:00.177Z

what is it?

- **Deleted on**2022-10-20T00:12:40.295Z

what is it?

- **arta@google.com** 2022-08-16T18:31:08.299Z

"Personal Data and Anonymization under the GDPR"

- **Deleted on**2022-10-20T00:12:40.295Z

"Personal Data and Anonymization under the GDPR"

- **xiaoyong@google.com** 2022-08-16T18:49:53.147Z

I requested access. Thanks for sharing 😊

- **Deleted on**2022-10-20T00:12:40.295Z

I requested access. Thanks for sharing 😊

- **arta@google.com** 2022-08-16T18:50:26.025Z

It is scary

- Deleted on 2022-10-20T00:12:40.295Z

It is scary

- arta@google.com 2022-08-16T18:50:33.275Z

The conservative view that is

- Deleted on 2022-10-20T00:12:40.295Z

The conservative view that is

- brchan@google.com 2022-08-16T18:50:46.400Z

i was about to comment in here.. but decided communicate with care

- Updated on 2022-08-16T18:50:51.032Z

i was about to comment in here.. but decided to communicate with care

- Deleted on 2022-10-20T00:12:40.295Z

i was about to comment in here.. but decided to communicate with care

- arta@google.com 2022-08-16T18:51:15.590Z

ephemeral chats are ok per legal

- Deleted on 2022-10-20T00:12:40.295Z

ephemeral chats are ok per legal

- arta@google.com 2022-08-16T18:51:18.632Z

esp when you have legal on it

- Deleted on 2022-10-20T00:12:40.295Z

esp when you have legal on it

- brchan@google.com 2022-08-16T18:51:34.477Z

is this ephemeral? i thought history is on

- Deleted on 2022-10-20T00:12:40.295Z

is this ephemeral? i thought history is on

- arta@google.com 2022-08-16T18:51:41.502Z

No this has history

- Deleted on 2022-10-20T00:12:40.295Z

No this has history

- arta@google.com 2022-08-16T18:52:09.060Z

but maybe not infinite history

- Deleted on 2022-10-20T00:12:40.295Z

but maybe not infinite history

- arta@google.com 2022-08-16T18:52:16.106Z

so maybe it is quasi ephemeral?

- Deleted on 2022-10-20T00:12:40.295Z

so maybe it is quasi ephemeral?

- arta@google.com 2022-08-16T18:52:17.930Z

lol

- Deleted on 2022-10-20T00:12:40.295Z

lol

- xiaoyong@google.com 2022-08-16T18:52:42.753Z

Also is this doc for submission to EC or for internal guidance?

- Deleted on 2022-10-20T00:12:40.295Z

Also is this doc for submission to EC or for internal guidance?

- arta@google.com 2022-08-16T18:52:53.353Z

Internal

- Deleted on 2022-10-20T00:12:40.295Z

Internal

- arta@google.com 2022-08-16T18:53:02.476Z

the EC doc was pushing the liberal approach

- Deleted on 2022-10-20T00:12:40.295Z

the EC doc was pushing the liberal approach

- xiaoyong@google.com 2022-08-16T18:53:48.851Z

ok, this makes me feel better

- Deleted on 2022-10-20T00:12:40.295Z

ok, this makes me feel better

- kalambur@google.com 2022-08-16T19:21:46.646Z

I'll have to give it a read through this week. I expected to see a pretty academic definition here tbh

- Deleted on 2022-10-20T00:12:40.295Z

I'll have to give it a read through this week. I expected to see a pretty academic definition here tbh

Other Substantive Chats

Exhibit 4LL

Custodian: Chris LaSala

Witness: Chris LaSala

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-012386226

Trial Exhibit No.: PTX0043

Message

From: Chris LaSala [chrisl@google.com]
Sent: 4/16/2009 3:12:07 AM
To: Chris LaSala [chrisl@google.com]
Subject: notes with jyoona

Janine: oh I thought you were waiting for contract

Sent at 8:44 PM on Wednesday

me: hi

if i can get it

i doubt its much different than 75% and 15%

which, isn't really that diff from 50% and 5%

yes, 15% is bigger than 5%

but 75>50

Janine: ...

what?

me: what?

Yell

Janine: ohhh

me: if they signed up for 75% share of retail
for 15%

Janine: sorry, I didn't realize you were talking about yell

me: i'm saying that 75 is bigger than 50

Janine: that was a really strange IM standalone

me: lol

Janine: yes that is a fact

me: keep up yoong

ok - let's look at your spreadsheet

Janine: I've put in default numbers that assumes that the only thing that changes is spend on Google,
everything else the same

you can of course complicate things by changing their spend on other media, sales cost etc.

me: right

Janine: but at the basicest level - if you only up your spend on Google and change nothing else, you're our
7.5% if your original share of retail was 35% and you were making 10% net margins

Sent at 8:54 PM on Wednesday

me: we

we'd have to up the % to 20% for them to break even
in your model

Janine: well, they could always be more efficient

me: but all things being equal

Janine: spend less on Yahoo

yes

Sent at 8:56 PM on Wednesday

me: however, if you move share of wallet to 45%
then you only have to move to 10% for them to break even

Janine: yes

but they're still worse off compared to sticking with their 35%

me: btw, i just linked cell b19 to b6

Janine: sure

I just thought you might want to play around with that

oh yay, you color coded to

me: lol

i'm a modeler

by heart

Sent at 9:01 PM on Wednesday

me: maz tells me YB has 55% toward media

Janine: maybe

they said they were contractually obligated to cap their margin at 50%

me: by us?

Janine: yes, they're contract does that

so on the phone today they said I could assume that their share of wallet was 50% (media) x 65% (Google) = 32.5%

if they've told Maz 55% to media outside of this call, that's that then

me: ok

Janine: when I asked them today what their actual numbers were, your Pat was not inclined to share

me: he was mad

so, i think i broke your 2nd part of the model

no, i didn't

Janine: no yo u didn't

me: if they start with 55% and break even

and they want to keep everything else the same

we'd have to pay 20% for them to move to our model

OR

they have to spend less elsewhere

(assuming their sales and platform costs are fixed in short term)

Janine: yup

I guess he knows what he wants when he asks for 30%

me: he does

Sent at 9:09 PM on Wednesday

me: why does it get worse for them if they are spending more on media

Janine: they get less gross margin?

me: yes

right

duh

Janine: this is fun, huh

me: yes

i'm wondering if we are penalizing people that already spend alot on media

Janine: i see

vs people that don't but have lower share to Google

me: wait

i'm not looking at the right #

we should be looking at the delta

Janine: yes

we were

when I said "worse off from before"

as in. - yes they breakeven, but they are still worse off from before

me: i was playing with #s to drive b25 to 0

i should be playing with #s to drive b27 to 0

that is the point of indifference

right?

Janine: yes

Sent at 9:16 PM on Wednesday

Exhibit 4MM

Custodian: Deepti Bhatnagar; Nitish Korula

Witness: Nitish Korula

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-009007872

Message

From: Nitish Korula [nitish@google.com]
Sent: 3/5/2021 9:56:16 PM
To: Deepti Bhatnagar [deeptib@google.com]

- **Nitish Korula**, 2021-03-05 13:56:16

Nick seems much more sensible on this than Brent, but I guess some of that is GDA vs. DV3

- **Nitish Korula**, 2021-03-05 13:57:23

And why not click-optimized spend?

- **Nitish Korula**, 2021-03-05 13:59:25

How many *years* I've had to listen to Ali say "your sellside revshare is too high, all the value is on the buy-side, lower your revshare and let us raise ours"

- **Deepti Bhatnagar**, 2021-03-05 14:05:51

yeah I know

- **Deepti Bhatnagar**, 2021-03-05 14:06:04

I heard that too when I was on buy-side

- **Deepti Bhatnagar**, 2021-03-05 14:06:58

When Ali heard that I was moving to sellside, the first thing he told me was to lower the AdX revshare 😊

- **Nitish Korula**, 2021-03-05 14:07:05

<cracks up>

Exhibit 4NN

Custodian: George Levitte; Nitish Korula

Witness: George Levitte; Nitish Korula

Bates No.: GOOG-DOJ-AT-00611433

Message

From: Nitish Korula [nitish@google.com]
Sent: 5/26/2020 4:01:41 PM
To: George Levitte [glevitte@google.com]

- **Nitish Korula, 2020-05-26 09:01:41**

Did you and Haskell reach out to Chris yet, btw?

- **George Levitte, 2020-05-26 09:01:51**

I'm speaking with him now

- **Nitish Korula, 2020-05-26 09:02:02**

Great, thanks

- **George Levitte, 2020-05-26 09:02:04**

or in a couple min from now

- **George Levitte, 2020-05-26 09:38:49**

just chatted with Chris, and we made a few updates

- **George Levitte, 2020-05-26 09:39:01**

Jedi ShowAds Errors -> committing to EOY launch goal

- **George Levitte, 2020-05-26 09:39:54**

Project 851 -> committing to experiment, but not to launch... need to see what the yield vs resource cost tradeoff looks like before deciding to move forward (currently fixing a rasta bug so original experiment #s not trustworthy)

- **George Levitte, 2020-05-26 09:40:52**

also added two new items for (1) better RTB event notifications on mapp w/ EOY launch goal, (2) investigate native impression discrepancy w/ FB - unclear what needs to be done but we'll need to spend cycles on it

- **George Levitte, 2020-05-26 09:41:42**

these are now in the 'apps monetization' headline proposal and I've commented in others as fyi / request for feedback

- **Nitish Korula, 2020-05-26 09:51:47**

Great, thanks!

Exhibit 400

Custodian: Nirmal Jayaram; Nitish Korula

Witness: Nirmal Jayaram; Nitish Korula

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-011558055

Nirmal Jayaram, 2020-10-14 11:07:44

Hey Nitish, not sure how closely you are in the loop on multi-call v2

Nirmal Jayaram, 2020-10-14 11:07:54

There are a number of issues on it right now

Nirmal Jayaram, 2020-10-14 11:08:00

I'm not sure it needs to be a CY blocker

Nirmal Jayaram, 2020-10-14 11:08:08

so we can take our time and launch it in Q1

Nirmal Jayaram, 2020-10-14 11:08:11

wdyt?

Nitish Korula, 2020-10-14 11:08:15

Not yet sure

Nitish Korula, 2020-10-14 11:09:31

I do want to get it out because I think that ideally we should have done it a while ago, and the longer we build on the less accurate classification, the harder it is to make a change. (That said, I think the new algorithm needs to be fixed so it's more accurate on transition probabilities, besides being more accurate on the chain itself.)

Nirmal Jayaram, 2020-10-14 11:09:47

right, but it's blocking other improvements right now

Nirmal Jayaram, 2020-10-14 11:10:01

and i'm not optimistic hearing about the issues we have enough time in Q4 with all the code freezes to get it out

Nitish Korula, 2020-10-14 11:10:03

So that's something I want to understand. What is it blocking

Nirmal Jayaram, 2020-10-14 11:10:49

bernanke fallback improvements, which needs a new key val infra

Nirmal Jayaram, 2020-10-14 11:11:16

this caused the latest issue we saw where because we assume new slots are on-platform, it caused a bunch of margin issues when the multi call table failed recently

Nirmal Jayaram, 2020-10-14 11:11:26

the new infra will allow us to treat this better

i can give you more details in an email

Nitish Korula, 2020-10-14 11:24:10

And we can't do this in parallel?

Nirmal Jayaram, 2020-10-14 11:26:23

doesn't seem so. I'll join the platform leads sync today at 1 PM PST

Nirmal Jayaram, 2020-10-14 13:08:39

Hi Nitish, I'm thinking we need to define the experiment we want to run that becomes the launch expt

Nitish Korula, 2020-10-14 13:08:50

Yes

Nirmal Jayaram, 2020-10-14 13:08:50

maybe the two of us can write a doc defining this experiment and the components

Nitish Korula, 2020-10-14 13:08:54

Sounds good

Nitish Korula, 2020-10-14 13:09:05

Do you want to also include Deepak?

Nirmal Jayaram, 2020-10-14 13:09:21

Ali pinged just the two of us. But I have a 1-1 with Ali later. I can ask him

Nirmal Jayaram, 2020-10-14 13:09:39

Ali thinks (and rightly so) the two of us have a full view of the ecosystem

Nirmal Jayaram, 2020-10-14 13:09:44

to help structure the roadmap

Nirmal Jayaram, 2020-10-14 13:09:56

Deepak has great visibility on parts of this related to audience

Nitish Korula, 2020-10-14 13:12:21

Ok, sounds good

Nitish Korula, 2020-10-14 13:12:55

Let me know either way

Nirmal Jayaram, 2020-10-14 13:13:22

will do

But yes, I think we can reasonably do that

Nitish Korula, 2020-10-14 14:46:36

It's actually really nice to hear Ali ask fundamental questions ☺

Nitish Korula, 2020-10-14 14:47:04

He pushes people in different directions that even if they don't pursue, are good for quality of thinking

Nirmal Jayaram, 2020-10-14 14:47:10

ya he is not too involved in the app space, but he is smart to quickly grasp things and ask good questions

Nitish Korula, 2020-10-14 15:06:56

What is this DAA project?

Nirmal Jayaram, 2020-10-14 15:08:40

decoupling acquisition and allocation

Nirmal Jayaram, 2020-10-14 15:09:05

it's in a research stage where we are trying to see if we can value and buy a query without running the auction

Nitish Korula, 2020-10-14 15:09:21

So it's a type-2 serving kind of thing?

Nirmal Jayaram, 2020-10-14 15:09:23

so presumably it will make the bids the same if we use the right features for building that model

Nirmal Jayaram, 2020-10-14 15:09:31

ya and then it has to be coupled with type-2 to save resources

Nirmal Jayaram, 2020-10-14 15:09:49

i didnt propose this because the timelines...

Nirmal Jayaram, 2020-10-14 15:19:01

Nitish, think of it this way. We didn't want to do awbid on apps, because we wanted to clear the path for bidding out

Nirmal Jayaram, 2020-10-14 15:19:16

Im worried this goes in the opposite direction for not much in way of long term benefit

Nirmal Jayaram, 2020-10-14 15:19:33

obviously this is a more recent concern since now we are aligned on bidding out

Nirmal Jayaram, 2020-10-14 15:19:44

and have responsibility towards getting it out as soon as we can

It's a fair question, yes

Exhibit 4PP

Custodian: David Mitby; Sissie Hsiao

Bates No.: GOOG-DOJ-AT-00860570

Message

From: David Mitby [dmitby@google.com]
Sent: 10/8/2020 4:16:24 PM
To: Sissie Hsiao [sissie@google.com]

• **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:16:24

my feedback on rolling it out... i think some of the "denial" comes from the fact that when cookie deprecation was first announced, there was a sense that if it doesn't "work" for pubs, chrome would do something different. I think now there's increasing realization that cookies are gone regardless of the cost (though 100% agree we need to communicate the cost *now*)... but need to message that somehow since people may still feel we're in "R&D+ mode" trying to see if no cookies are even viable

• **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:17:25

second point would be on motivation -- i think it's hard to get people fired up here without knowing the why; like are we doing something really better for users? cool tech that's a better future of the web? or is it really just a response to inevitable regulation and chrome defensiveness?

• **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:17:34

the more it's the latter, the harder to get people super fired up for the year

• **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:19:29

Yah, I hear you

• **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:19:31

However.

• **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:19:40

The reality is this was pushed on us. Any other story, is frankly, wrong

• **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:19:46

i agree

• **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:19:50

as for R&D into reality mode

• **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:20:04

I would say, the initial results on Floc and Rmktg (again, super early) don't indicate to me enough \$\$s to pump the brakes

• **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:20:09

and shouldn't make it up as something better for users if it actually isn't (and that would even suggest what we've been doing so far is bad, which I don't think it is)

• **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:20:11

Certainly, not enough \$\$s for Sundar to pump the brakes

• **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:20:22

I know b/c I already showed him those \$\$s in broad swath

• **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:20:30

exactly

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:20:36

I don't want to say "we were sucking before";

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:20:42

100% agree

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:20:43

we are caught in the crosswind of regulators and apple

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:20:45

and we need to respond

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:20:51

we weren't doing anything *wrong*

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:21:03

and saying we were sucking before implies that we should completely walk away from Anning on Apps which I don't think we (yet) should do

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:21:22

Mike and Vids are pushing me pretty hard to put kanon on the Android roadmap, fwiw

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:21:29

even if it's not 2021 response

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:21:40

the other thing is - will and folk have already sold kanon to regulators

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:21:52

that's what worries me more. Our response to Irish DPC on RTB is k-anon.

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:21:56

i think we just need to settle whether it's a hedge vs. a true burn the ships approach

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:22:05

I'm worried that "ship has sailed" because of what we said to regulators to get them off our backs.

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:22:06

yup, that's brutal

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:22:22

but in terms of cost, i really don't think the O&O impact has been understood too

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:22:30

I agree w that

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:22:35

that's what I said to Jerry and team

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:22:40

especially YT

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:22:43

did we tee up the real \$ price tag of privacy?

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:22:48

and with Tim being new and no one looking at it...

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:22:50

if not, let's do that now

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:23:03

I think Jerry gets that now, so I expect some action

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:23:06

it's a very pivotal moment

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:23:27

even so, O&O will say save link deco, right?

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:23:31

and protect EC

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:23:34

and cust match

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:23:42

people say that but not really -- it would go into aggregate apis

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:23:46

as I understand it

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:23:47

link deco, IMO, is not really having to be killed.

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:24:01

EC and Cust match have to go to aggregate as well?

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:24:03

I haven't heard that.

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:24:06

I agree but sounds like Chrome is readying public statements that they will kill it?

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:24:36

Yeah the slippery slope here (and I honestly don't think I'm being dramatic) is the full loss of any personalized advertising

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:24:38

I think if I were Jerry, that's the part I would argue for stay of execution. Not clear that's really necessary. But I don't know the \$ difference, since most of the bidding teams have been ignoring the msmt team's event level API efforts.

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:24:56

since everything has to go aggregate, and I don't even think EC across 1P properties (YT, G.com, etc) is tenable given antitrust

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:25:00

well fwiw, I don't think the clustering is *that* bad.

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:25:12

I think they're thinking 1000 kanon. for targeting at least, that doesn't seem too awful.

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:25:26

on EC, I don't get the antitrust point

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:25:31

Everyone who has sign in, can go for it, right?

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:25:48

right now, yes -- but do you think we can (in 5 years) for sure keep using like G.com data on YT and vice versa?

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:26:03

especially when other players can't share data?

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:26:23

that's an extension of the big tech ++ argument

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:26:25

maybe that's a far out risk and coupled more with potential company break-up... but i could see intermediates where we are told not to mix data across

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:27:23

right, that part might be far out but not having cookies or device ids accelerates the wall garden approaches (e.g. Amazon and FB should buy up a bunch of properties to share data between), which further casts scrutiny on antitrust, including on Google

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:28:22

yah

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:28:23

that is the arc

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:28:26

dunno what to do

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:28:34

i feel there isn't enough for sundar to pump the brakes

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:28:36

only to maybe stall

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:28:46

and evenso, ads has totally not got their stuff in order

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:28:48

no \$ associated yet

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:29:22

i think there is enough hit with Android to pump brakes -- \$XXB

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:30:22

y so let's land something reasonable in 2021 so that the later parts are deferred...maybe forever don't know

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:30:48

we will continue to have Mike poke

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:30:51

(and probably Vids too)

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:31:01

it's very situational to how apple pushes

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:31:13

i think also the lesson from chrome should be to not proactively announce or go a direction that costs \$XXB until the alternative solutions are really ready

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:31:35

unless we're completely pushed either by regulation or like iphones flying off the shelves due to perceptions of privacy deltas

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:32:03

I think Mike and team would argue, let's build that alternative in the background

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:32:04

i could only see that if we think we aren't investing enough in like ODA because it's only a hedge, but seems solvable to invest there as a very real hedge vs. R&D

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:32:14

i don't think anyone disagrees with that

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:32:15

I don't disagree, but that's a fxn of resourcing, to me.

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:32:42

I think we should ask for both. Plan A and also a backup build for Plan B (k-anon)

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:32:53

yes, i think there's alignment that we need to do more on Android with aggregation / ODA... but just want to avoid some public announcements and also wouldn't want to hold back efforts to make device_id more likely to survive the long-term

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:33:00

what's ODA

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:33:04

on device ads

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:33:08

oh ok

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:33:12

how exactly would ODA work?

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:33:52

good question 😊. roughly it's the gboard thing where you have models running on the phone, and the training data that gets sent to servers is aggregated so it's not PII, and then models come back to the phone

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:34:29

works better though for something like gBoard autocomplete because you don't need to have a near unlimited corpus of options, like we do in ads... for ads right now you end up precaching like a few thousand ads on the device to choose from

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:34:50

so unclear how to fully bridge that where you could pull from millions of candidates

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:35:12

and of course issues with battery life and such

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:35:26

Have you talked with Deepak about the Turtle Augury stuff?

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 09:35:33

They're trying to predict what ads to send down to cache.

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:35:43

and with both aggregation and ODA, i think serious issues in the biz model since we put our IP into making the clusters, and are generally having to give that away for free to a more leveled playing field IMO

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:35:56

yeah, can use similar for ODA... so it's plausible

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:36:24

i mean even server-side auctions do some shard retrieval that isn't per-auction, so the idea of starting with a limited set of ads isn't totally deal breaker

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:37:16

to me we should resource these alternatives, and then have internal alignment on realistic timelines and the revenue tradeoff we'd take to proactively jump to them

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:38:20

i'd personally also push sundar-level to take more of a stance on the user value of ads personalization and driving free content to try to change the narrative

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:38:53

we're an ads company that's retreating from ads... and we have YT content creators and such that will take 30%+ hits in their paychecks for no real user value on the other side

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:40:01

FB is taking more of a stand:

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 09:40:02

https://www.google.com/url?q=https://www.cnbc.com/2020/10/06/facebook-revenue-chief-says-ad-supported-model-is-under-assault-.html&sa=D&source=hangouts&ust=1602261602636000&usg=AFQjCNHUGdHsM_dGPKPpZ69Pls_W0u9Lzw

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 10:21:00

hearing rumors that our retail HC is coming through from the pragh grant?

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 10:23:13

maybe, i'm hearinv positive vibes

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 10:23:17

on this one here

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 10:23:30

200-600 incremental gross rev... doesn't seem super high for maybe not small work?

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 10:24:37

yeah, i personally think it's on the higher end of that (sellside of course thinks it's low), but either way not crazy massive... i think fair to drill in on the work but generally is a reuse of awbid work already done and just some contract shifting, and proably long-term saves heads potentially due to dropping multical complexity over time

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 10:27:17

mm.. contracts... integration with mopub+ 5 other platforms...

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 10:27:28

may need per platform bidding tuning

- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 10:29:31

on the retail HC, sounds like it's more of a done deal (UX pinging me) and even in Pez already

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 10:34:28

ux hears way ahead of me!

- **Sissie Hsiao**, 2020-10-08 10:34:29



- **David Mitby**, 2020-10-08 10:35:40

vultures when it comes to HC ...

Exhibit 4QQ

Custodian: Adam Juda

Bates No.: GOOG-AT-MDL-012534780

Message

From: pfb@google.com [pfb@google.com]
Sent: 3/2/2023 11:44:01 PM
To: pfb@google.com; juda@google.com
Subject: qnpOGkAAAAE-MBI-FLAT:2023-03-02T04:44:01.591776

pfb@google.com March 2, 2023 at 11:44:01 PM UTC

Re Vinden renewal - early flag that AdSpam have some serious invalid traffic concerns about the Prorateer section of Vinden's business. They may want to advocate not to renew the contract.

pfb@google.com March 2, 2023 at 11:44:12 PM UTC

I don't have share access but this is their summary doc -

<https://docs.google.com/document/d/1osE3FQTBjV1wxJkflEtVZhXP9v5une1Gk1wyK0XevSg/edit?usp=drivesdk&resourcekey=0-yGVWFoh7-o-DjQ9ZSoisUQ> Summary - suspicious shift in traffic from IN/ BD to US following geoRT launch (go/disable-geort-aoi-launch), traffic from data centers (possibly VPNs) along with specific advertisers complaints about invalid activity.

<https://drive.google.com/open?id=1osE3FQTBjV1wxJkflEtVZhXP9v5une1Gk1wyK0XevSg>

<https://docs.google.com/document/d/1osE3FQTBjV1wxJkflEtVZhXP9v5une1Gk1wyK0XevSg/edit?usp=drivesdk&resourcekey=0-yGVWFoh7-o-DjQ9ZSoisUQ>

<http://goto.google.com/disable-geort-aoi-launch>

pfb@google.com March 2, 2023 at 11:44:49 PM UTC

My team will work to get AdSpam's viewpoint represented to gAFS (possibly inviting Per to attend).

juda@google.com March 2, 2023 at 11:47:54 PM UTC

sounds like a plan. my understanding is that it is currently unclear if Vinden is only "guilty" of using GDN to source traffic, or if Vinden behind the scenes is also the source of the bad traffic flowing through their GDN campaigns.

Happy to go wherever data and truth take us though.

pfb@google.com March 2, 2023 at 11:49:26 PM UTC

